

Evolution of Corvids and their Presence in the Neogene and the Quaternary in the Carpathian Basin

Jenő (Eugen) KESSLER

Received: September 09, 2019 - Revised: February 12, 2020 - Accepted: February 18, 2020



Kessler, J. (E.) 2020. Evolution of Corvids and their Presence in the Neogene and the Quaternary in the Carpathian Basin. – Ornis Hungarica 28(1): 121–168. DOI: 10.2478/orhu-2020-0009

Abstract: Corvids are the largest songbirds in Europe. They are known in the avian fauna of Europe from the Miocene, the beginning of the Neogene, and are currently represented by 11 species. Due to their size, they occur more frequently among fossilized material than other types of songbirds, and thus have been examined to the largest extent. In the current article, we present their known evolution and their

fossilized taxa in Europe and examine the osteology of extant species.

Keywords: Corvidae, Neogene, Quaternary, Europe, Carpathian Basin, osteology

Összefoglalás: A varjúfélék a legnagyobb termetű, Európában is elterjedt énekesmadarak. A kontinens madárfaunájában a neogén elejétől, a miocénból ismertek, és jelenleg 11 fajjal vannak képviselve. Termetük következtében gyakrabban előfordulnak a fosszilis anyagban, mint a többi énekesmadár típus, és ennek következtében nagyobb mértékben is tanulmányozták őket. Jelen tanulmányban bemutatjuk az ismert európai evolúciójukat és fosszilis taxonjaikat, és foglalkozunk a recens fajok csonttanával is.

Kulcsszavak: Corvidae, neogén, negyedidőszak, Európa, Kárpát-medence, csonttan

Department of Paleontology, Eötvös Loránd University, 1117 Budapest, Pázmány Péter sétány 1/c, Hungary, e-mail: kessler_jeno@yahoo.com

Introduction

About half of the current avian species – if not more – consists of songbirds, which are distributed all around the world apart from Antarctica with a large number of specimens. Despite this fact, we know little of their origins and evolution. They supposedly formed in the ancient continent of Gondwana, but their fossilized remains in the Palearctic and Nearctic are only known from the Neogene, and even those only in small numbers. Recently, however, their research received a boost, and thus the number of identified and described taxa and new fossil species increased (Kessler 2013a, 2013b, 2015).

The families of the order Corvidae are an exception to this, and due to their larger size, they were always in the focus of interest of paleornithologists. Most songbird species had been described during the past two centuries from this family. During their classification, we follow the Brodkorb type of systematics, since those that are based on DNA data (Sibley & Ahlquits 1990, Monroe & Sibley 1993, Jarvis *et al.* 2014) cannot be used in case of fossils in the absence of comparative molecular material, and other types of systematics classify solely based

on appearance and feathers, excluding skeletons that can be examined within the framework of paleontology (e.g. Clements 1974, Cramp 1998, Dickinson & Christidis 2014).

Brodkorb (1978) distinguishes two subfamilies within the family:

- Garbulinae (Bole, 1825) to which he only classifies Nearctic taxa (Miocitta, Protocitta, Hetocitta) from the Neogene and Quaternary of North America. Examples of this are *†Miocitta galbreathy* (Brodkorb 1972) (from the Miocene of Colorado), *†Protocitta ayax* Brodkorb, 1972 (from the Pliocene of Kansas and Texas), *†P. dixi* (Brodkorb 1957) (from the Pleistocene of Florida and Texas), *†Henocitta brodkorbi* Holman 1959 (from the Pleistocene of Florida);
- Corvinae (Bonaparte 1831), where the Palearctic species belong. Brodcorb mentions the following species from outside Europe: Corvus †wetmorei (Brodkorb, 1959) (from the Pleistocene of Bahama), C. †pumilis (Wetmore, 1920) (from the Quaternary of Puerto Rico and the Virgin Islands), C. †moriorum (Forbes, 1892) (from the Quaternary of the Chatham Islands). Apart from the Corvidae finds, crow remains were recently described from the Miocene of North America (Olson & Rasmussen 2001) report the taxon Corvus aff ossifragus (Wilson, 1812) from the site at Lee Creek Mine, based on a tibiotarsus find.

We discuss fossil corvids of the western Palearctic and the Carpathian Basin in the systematic section after the osteology chapter.

Abbreviations: Q1-Q2 – Lower Pleistocene; Q3 (Q3/I-Q3/II) – Middle Pleistocene; Q4/I – Upper Pleistocene; Q4/II – Holocene; † – extinct/fossil species – subspecies.

A – total lengths; B – partial lengths; C – breadth of proximal epiphysis; C1 – partial breadth of proximal epiphysis; D – thickness of proximal epiphysis; E – breadth of diaphysis; E1 – partial breadth of diaphysis; F – breadth of distal epiphysis; G – thickness of distal epiphysis; H – height of distal epiphysis.

Osteology of Corvids

Anatomical terminology (after: Milne-Edwards 1868, Fürbringer 1888, Lambrecht 1933, Ballmann 1966, Mourer-Chauviré 1975, Baumel *et al.* 1979, Gilbert *et al.* 1981, Cheneval 1983, Jánossy 1985, Solti 1996, Tomek & Bochenski 2000, Kessler 2013a) (*Figure 1*).

Method of measurement: (after: von den Driesch 1976, Gál 2002, Kessler 2013b) (Figure 2).

- A = TL total length;
- B = PL partial length;
- C = Bp breadth of the proximal end;
- C1 = partial breadth of the proximal end;
- D = partial length of the proximal end;
- E = Sc breadth of the corpus;
- E1 = partial breadth of the corpus;
- F = Bd breadth of the distal end;
- G = thickness of the distal end;
- H = height of the distal end.



Figure 1. Corvus corax Linnaeus, 1758 osteology characters:

1. Mandibula: a. the pointed end of the rostrum mandibulae; b. the immersed part of the rostrum; c. the ramus mandibulae, pars symphysialis;

2. Coracoideum: a. the processus acrocoracoidalis; b. the processus procoracoidalis; c. the sulcus musculi supracoracoideus; d. the angulus medialis; e. the processus lateralis;

3. Scapula: a. the dorsal branch of the acromion; b. the lateral branch of the acromion; c. the pit between the branches of the acromion; d. the corpus scapulae;

4. Humerus, epiphysis proximalis: a. the tuberculum ventrale; b. the crista bicipitalis; c. the edge between crista bicipitalis and corpus humeri; d. the fossa pneumotricipitalis;

5. Humerus, epiphysis distalis: a. the tuberculum supracondylare ventrale; b. the processus flexorius; c. the condylus dorsalis; d. the processus supracondylaris dorsalis;

6. Ulna, epiphysis proximalis: a. the olecranon; b. the cotyla dorsalis; c. the impressio brachialis;

7. Ulna, epiphysis distalis: a. the condylus dorsalis ulnaris; b. the sulcus intercondylaris; c. the condylus ventralis ulnaris; d. the tuberculum carpale;

8. Radius: a. the tuberculum aponeurosis ventrale; b. the tuberculum aponeurosis dorsale;

9. Carpometacarpus: a. the trochlea carpalis; b. the processus extensorius; c. the processus alularis; d. the fovea subalularis; e. the protuberantia metacarpale majus; f. the facies articularis digitale minor;

10. Phalanx proximalis digiti majoris: a. the margo proximalis; b. the tuberculum ventralis; c. the tuberculum dorsalis; d. the margo dorsalis; e. the margo distalis;

11. Femur, epiphysis distalis: a. the condylus medialis; b. the condylus lateralis; c. the sulcus intercondylaris; d. the epicondylus medialis; e. the epicondylus lateralis;

12. *Tibiotarsus*, epiphysis distalis: a. the *epicondylus lateralis*; b. the *tuberculum retinaculum musculi fibularis*; c. the *incisura intercondylaris*;

13. Tarsometatarsus, epiphysis distalis: a. the margo medialis; b. the troclea metatarsi II.: c. the trochlea metatarsi III.; d. the trochlea metatarsi IV.;

14. *Phalanx ungularis*: a. the *tuberculum extensorium*; b. the *cotyla articularis*; c. the *tuberculum flexorium*; d. the curvature of the *margo plantaris*; e. the *apex phalangis*

1. ábra Corvus corax Linnaeus, 1758 csonttani jellegek:

1. Alsó állkapocs: a. a rostrum mandibulae hegye; b. bemélyedés a rostrum-on; c. ramus mandibulae, pars symphysialis; 2. Hollócsőrcsont: a. processus acrocoracoidalis; b. processus procoracoidalis; c. sulcus musculi supracoracoideus; d. angulus medialis; e. processus lateralis;

3. Lapocka: a. az acromion dorzális ága; b. az acromion oldalsó ága; c. az acromion ágai közti bemélyedés alakja; d. corpus scapulae;

4. Felkarcsont, proximális vég: a. tuberculum ventrale; b. crista bicipitalis; c. a crista bicipitalis és a corpus humeri közti él jellege; d. fossa pneumotricipitalis;

5. Felkarcsont, disztális vég: a. tuberculum supracondylare ventrale; b. processus flexorius; c. condylus dorsalis; d. processus supracondylaris dorsalis;

6. Singcsont proximális vég: a. olecranon; b. cotyla dorsalis; c. impressio brachialis;

7. Singcsont disztális vég: a. condylus dorsalis ulnaris; b. sulcus intercondylaris; c. condylus ventralis ulnaris; d. tuberculum carpale;

8. Orsócsont: a. tuberculum aponeurosis ventrale; b. tuberculum aponeurosis dorsale;

9. Kézközépcsont: a. trochlea carpalis; b. processus extensorius; c. processus alularis; d. fovea subalularis; e. protuberantia metacarpale majus; f. facies articularis digitale minor;

10. A nagy kézujj első ujjperce: a. margo proximalis; b. tuberculum ventralis; c. tuberculum dorsalis; d. margo dorsalis; e. margo distalis;

11. Combcsont, disztális vég: a. condylus medialis; b. condylus lateralis; c. sulcus intercondylaris; d. epicondylus medialis; e. epicondylus lateralis;

12. Lábszárcsont, disztális vég: a. epicondylus lateralis; b. tuberculum retinaculum musculi fibularis; c. incisura intercondylaris;

13. Csüd, disztális vég: a. margo medialis; b. troclea metatarsi II.: c. trochlea metatarsi III.; d. trochlea metatarsi IV.;

14. Karomcsont: a. tuberculum extensorium; b. cotyla articularis; c. tuberculum flexorium; d. a margo plantaris íve; e. apex phalangis



Figure 2. Measurements methods of bones:

1. Mandibula: A. total length; B. length of the rostrum; C. breadth of the rostrum;

2. Coracoideum: A. total length; B. partial length; C. length of the processus procoracoidalis; D. breadth of the corpus and processus procoracoidalis; E. breadth of the corpus; F. total breadth of the distal end; G. partial breadth of the distal end.

3. Scapula: A. total length; C. breadth of the proximal end; E. breadth of the corpus;

4-5. *Humerus*: A. total length; B. partial length 1; C. breadth of the proximal end; D. partial length 2; E. breadth of the corpus; F. breadth of the distal end; G. thickness of the distal end; H. height of the distal end;

6-7. *Ulna*: A. total length; B. length of the proximal epiphysis; C. breadth of the proximal end; E. breadth of the corpus; F. breadth of the distal end; G. thickness of the distal end;

8. Radius: A. total length; F. breadth of the distal end;

9. *Carpometacarpus*: A. total length; B. partial length; C. breadth of the proximal end; D. length of the processus extensorius; E. breadth of the corpus; E1: breadth of the metacarpus majus; F. breadth of the distal end;

10. *Phalanx proximalis digiti majoris*: A. total length; C. breadth of the proximal end; E. breadth of the corpus; F. breadth of the distal end;

11. Femur: A. total length; B. partial length 1.; C. breadth of the proximal end; E. breadth of the corpus; F. breadth of the distal end; G. thickness of the distal end;

12. *Tibiotarsus*: A. total length; C. breadth of the proximal end; E. breadth of the corpus; F. breadth of the distal end; G. thickness of the distal end;

13. Tarsometatarsus: A. total length; C. breadth of the proximal end; E. breadth of the corpus; F. breadth of the distal end; G. thickness of the distal end;

14. *Phalanx ungularis*: A. total length; B. length of the *cotyla articularis*; C. breadth of the proximal end; D. length of the *tuberculum flexorium*; E. breadth of the *corpus*

2. ábra A csontok mérési mintái:

1. Alsó állkapocs: A. teljes hossz; B. a csőr vég hossza; C. a csőrvég szélessége;

2. Hollócsőrcsont: A. teljes hossz; B. részleges hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; E. a test szélessége; F. a disztális vég szélessége; G. a disztális vég részleges szélessége;

3. Lapockacsont: A. teljes hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; E. a test szélessége;

4-5. Felkarcsont: A. teljes hossz; B. részleges hossz 1.; C. proximális vég szélessége; D. részleges hossz 2.; E. a test szélessége; F. a disztális vég szélessége; G. a disztális vég vastagsága; disztális vég magassága;

6-7. Singcsont: A. teljes hossz; B. részleges hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; E. a test szélessége; F. a disztális vég szélessége; G. a disztális vég vastagsága;

8. Orsócsont: A. teljes hossz; F. a disztális vég szélessége;

9. Kézközépcsont: A. teljes hossz; B. részleges hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; D. a *processus flexorius* hossza; E. a test szélessége; E1: a *metacarpus majus* vastagsága; F. a disztális vég szélessége;

10. Kézujjperc (II. ujj, 1. perc): A. teljes hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; E. a test szélessége; F. a disztális vég szélessége;

11. Combcsont: A. teljes hossz; B. részleges hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; E. a test szélessége; F. a disztális vég szélessége; G. a disztális vég vastagsága;

12. Lábszárcsont: A. teljes hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; E. a test szélessége; F. a disztális vég szélessége; G. a disztális vég vastagsága;

13. Csüd: A. teljes hossz; C. proximális vég szélessége; E. a test szélessége; F. a disztális vég szélessége; G. a disztális vég vastagsága;

14. karomcsont: A. teljes hossz; B. izületi vápa hossza; C. proximális vég szélessége; D. a *processus flexorius* szélessége; E. a test szélessége

1. Mandibula (Figure 3)

1.a the pointed end of the *rostrum mandibulae*:

- medium long and medium width: Corvus, Garrulus, Pica;
- long and narrow: Pyrrhocorax;
- long and medium width: Nucifraga;

1.b the immersed part of the *rostrum*:

- narrow semicircular: Pyrrhocorax;
- pointed: Corvus frugilegus;
- ovoid: Corvus corax, C. corone, C. monedula, Pica;
- semi-circle with small recess: Garrulus;
- wide semi-circle: Nucifraga;

1.c the form of the ramus mandibulae:

- short: Nucifraga;
- long and medium wide: Corvus, Garrulus, Pica;
- long and narrow: Pyrrhocorax;

2. Coracoideum (Figure 4)

2.a the processus acrocoracoideus (tuberculum brachiale):

- curved and pointed: Corvus corax, C. monedula, Garrulus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;
- narrow and pointed: Nucifraga;
- strongly curved and pointed: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus;

2.b the *acrocoracoideum*:

- semicircular: Corvus corone, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- wide cone-shaped: Corvus moinedula, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- assymmetric cone-shaped: Corvus corax, C. frugilegus;
- small pointed cone-shaped: Garrulus;
- small bunted cone-shaped: Nucifraga;

2.c the sulcus musculi supracoracoidei:

- symmetrically semicircular: Corvus, Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax;
- flattened: Nucifraga, Pica;

2.d the angulus medialis:

- pointed: Garrulus, Nucifraga;
- pointed and curved: Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- protruding: Corvus monedula, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- truncated: Corvus corax, C. corone, C. frugilegus, Pica;

2.e the processus lateralis:

- semicircular-shaped: Corvus frugilegus, Garralus, Nucifraga, Pica;
- symmetric truncated: Corvus corone, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- asymmetric truncated: Corvus corax, C. monedula, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;

3. Scapula (Figure 5)

3.a the length of the branches of *acromion***:**

- symmetrically (equal): Nucifraga, Pica;
- asymmetrically (unequal): Corvus, Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax;



Figure 3. Mandibula (dorsal surface): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula;
5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus
3. ábra Alsó állkapocs (háti nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula;
5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus



Figure 4. Left coracoideum (ventral surface): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

4. ábra Bal oldali hollócsőrcsont (hasi oldal): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4.
 C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax



Figure 5. Right scapula (medial surface): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

5. ábra Jobb oldali lapocka csont (mediális oldal): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus;
4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

3.b the shape of the branches of *acromion*:

- symmetrically (equal): Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- asymmetrically (unequal): Corvus, Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;

3.c the apex dorsalis (dorsal branch):

- short and blunted: Corvus frugilegus, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- short and pointed: Corvus corax, C. corone, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- long and blunted: Corvus monedula, Nucifraga, Pica;
- long and pointed: Garrulus;

3.d the apex lateralis (lateral branch):

- short and blunted: Garrulus;
- short and pointed: Corvus corone, C. monedula;
- long and blunted: Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- long and pointed: Corvus corax, C. frugilegus, Pyrrhocorax graculus;

3.e the pit between the branches:

- shallow and symmetrical: *Corvus corone, C. monedula, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax*;

- shallow and unsymmetrical: Corvus corax, C. frugilegus, Garrulus;
- straight: Pyrrhocorax graculus;

3.f the shape of corpus:

- curved: Garrulus, Nucifraga;
- very wide: Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- wide: Corvus cornix; C. frugilegus;
- moderately wide: Corvus corax, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pyrrhocorax graculus;

- narrow: Pica;

4. Humerus (proximal epiphysis) (Figure 6)

4.a the *tuberculum ventrale*:

- strongly protruding: Corvus, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- poorly protruding: Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;

4.b the projection of the *crista bicipitalis*:

- prominent and rounded: Garrulus;
- truncated: Pica, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- rounded and not prominent: Corvus, Nucifraga, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;

4.c the distal edge of the crista bicipitalis:

- flatly curved: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, C. monedula, Nucifraga;
- strongly curved: Corvus corax, Garrulus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- straight: Pyrrhocorax graculus;

4.d the fossa pneumotricipitalis:

- split: Corvus, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;

5. Humerus (distal epiphysis) (Figure 7)

5.a the tuberculum supracondylare ventrale:

- protuberant: Corvus corax;



Figure 6. Left humerus (caudal surface): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

6. ábra Bal oldali felkarcsont (palmáris oldal): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax



Figure 7. Left humerus (cranial surface): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

7. ábra Bal oldali felkarcsont (dorzális oldal): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4.
 C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax



Figure 8. Left ulna (ventral aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

8. ábra Bal oldali singcsont (hasi nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

- not prominent: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;

5.b the processus flexorius:

- with rounded end: Corvus frugilegus, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax graculus;

- with truncated end: Corvus corax, C. monedula, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- with asymmetrical cone end: Corvus corone;

5.c the condylus dorsalis:

– rounded: Corvus corax, C. corone, C. frugilegus, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;

5.d the processus supracondylaris dorsalis:

– two-pronged unequal: *Corvus corax, C. corone, C. frugilegus, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;*

6. Ulna (proximal epiphysis) (Figure 8)

6.a the *olecranon*:

- short and blunt: Corvus;
- long and blunt: Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- asymmetrical and pointed: Pyrrhocorax graculus;

6.b the cotyla dorsalis:

- semicircular: Garrulus;
- conical asymmetrical: Corvus corax, C. corone, C. frugilegus;
- conical: Nucifraga;
- pointed conical: Pyrrhocorax;
- truncated: Corvus monedula;
- long and blunt: Pica;

6.c. the tuberculum ligamentum collateralis ventralis:

- developed: Garrulus;
- undeveloped: Corvus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;

7. Ulna (distal epiphysis) (Figure 9)

7.a the shape of the *condylus dorsalis*:

- pointed cone: Corvus corone, Nucifraga;
- blunted cone: Corvus corax, C. frugilegus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;
- rounded: Corvus monedula, Garrulus;

7.b the shape of the *sulcus intercondylaris*:

- curved: Corvus corax, C. corone, Garrulus;
- asymmetrically curved: Corvus frugilegus;
- pointed: Corvus monedula, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;

7.d the shape of the *condylus ventralis*:

- conical: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, Nucifraga, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- blunt cone: Corvus corax, Garrulus;
- rounded: Corvus monedula, Pica;
- semicircle: Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;



Figure 9. Left ulna (dorsal aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

9. ábra Bal oldali singcsont (háti nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

7.e the shape of the *tuberculum carpale*:

- semicircular: Corvus modeula, Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax;
- conical: Corvus frugilegus, Nucifraga;
- asymmetrical: Corvus corax, C. corone;
- truncated: Pica;

8. Radius (Figure 10)

8.a the shape of the tuberculum aponeurosis ventralis:

- conical: Corvus corax; Garrulus glandarius, Nucifraga caryocatactes;
- blunted cone: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- rounded: Pica, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- oblique rectangle: Corvus monedula;

8.b the shape of the tuberculum aponeurosis dorsalis:

- blunted cone: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- symmetrical blunted cone: Corvus corax, Nucifraga;
- rounded: Corvus monedula, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- semicircular: Pica;

8. Carpometacarpus (Figure 11)

8.a the shape of the a *trochlea carpalis*:

- semicircle: Corvus frugilegus;
- asymmetrically semicircle: Corvus corax;
- symmetrically cone: Corvus corone, C. monedula;
- symmetrically blunt cone: Pyrrhocorax;
- asymmetrically blunt cone: Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica;

8.b the form of the *processus extensorius*:

- pointed cone: Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- slanting pointy cone: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus;
- leaning blunt cone: Corvus monedula, Garrulus;
- extension with rounded end: Corvus corax, Nucifraga;
- asymmetrically: Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;

8.c the shape of the processus alularis:

- rectangular: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;
- rounded: Corvus corax;

8.d the form of the *fovea subalularis*:

- conical groove: Corvus corax, Pica;
- irregular conical groove: Corvus mondedula, Nucifraga;
- missed: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus; Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax;

8.e the shape of the facies articularis digitale major:

- rounded: Corvus monedula, Garrulus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;
- straight: Corvus frugilegus, Nucifraga;
- oblique: Corvus corax, C. corone;



Figure 10. Left radius (dorsal aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula;
5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

10. ábra Bal oldali orsócsont (háti nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax



Figure 11. Left carpometacarpus (ventral aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

11. ábra Bal oldali kézközépcsont (hasi nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

8.f the shape of the facies articularis digitale minor:

- rounded: Corvus corax, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- with cut-off end: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- asymmetricall cone: Garrulus, Nucifraga;
- concave: Corvus monedula;

9. Phalanx proximalis digiti majoris (Figure 12)

9.a the form of the *margo proximalis*:

- strongly bulging: Nucifraga;
- weakly bulging: Corvus corax, C. corone, Garrulus;
- with a little protrusion: Corvus frugilegus, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- flattened: Corvus monedula, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;

9.b the form of the *tuberculum ventralis*:

- rounded: Corvus corax, C. corone, Pyrrhocorax graculus;
- symmetrical blunt cone: Corvus frugilegus, C. monedula, Pica, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- asymmetrical blunt cone: Nucifraga;

9.c the form of the *tuberculum dorsalis*:

- pointed cone: Pyrrhocorax;
- symmetrical bunt cone: Corvus corax, C. monedula, Nucifraga, Pica;
- asymmetrical bunt cone: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus;
- semicircle: Garrulus;

9.d the character of the margo dorsalis:

- rounded: Corvus corax, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- straight: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, Pica, Garrulus;
- wavy: Corvus monedula, Nucifraga, Pyrrhocorax graculus;

9.e the character of the margo distalis:

- rounded: Garrulus, Pica;
- wavy: Corvus, Nucifraga, Pyrrhocorax;

10. Femur (distal epiphysis) (Figure 13)

10.a the shape of the condylus medialis:

- semicircle: Corvus;
- blunt cone: Garrulus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;
- pointed cone: Nucifraga;

10.b the character of the sulcus intercondylaris:

- deeply concave: Corvus moedula, C. frugilegus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;
- weakly concave: Garrulus, Nucifraga;
- cone shaped: Corvus corax, C. corone;

10.c the shape of the *condylus lateralis*:

- broadly rounded: Nucifraga;
- rounded: Corvus, Pyrrhocorax;
- conical: Garrulus, Pica;

140



Figure 12. Left phalanx proximalis digiti majoris (ventral aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

12. ábra Bal oldali kézujjperc (l. ujjperc, 2. ujj, hasi nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax



Figure 13. Right femur (caudal aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

13. ábra Jobb oldali combcsont (palmáris nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus;
 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

10.d the form of the epicondylus medialis:

- pointedly protruding: Corvus;
- rounded protruding: Nucifraga;
- not arching: Garrulus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;

10.e the form of the *epicondylus lateralis*:

- rounded protruding: Nucifraga;
- bulging: Corvus, Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax;
- not arching: Pica;

11. *Tibiotarsus* (distal *epiphysis*) (*Figure 14*) **11.a** the shape of the *epicondylus lateralis*:

- rounded: Corvus corone, G. frugilegus, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pyrrhocorax;

- semicircular: Pica;
- asymmetrical: Corvus corax, C. monedula;

11.b the form of the incisura intercondylaris:

- wavy: Corvus corone, C. frugilegus, C. monedula;
- asymmetrically arched: Corvus corax, Pyrrhocorax;
- asymmetrically wavy: Garrulus;
- flattened: Nucifraga, Pica;

11.c the character of the tuberculum retinaculi musculi fibularis:

- weakly protruding: Corvus frugilegus, Pyrrhocorax;
- strongly protruding: Corvus corax, C. corone, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica;

12. Tarsometatarsus (distal epiphysis) (Figure 15)

12.a the character of the margo medialis:

- straight: Corvus corax, C. corone, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga, Pica, Pyrrhocorax; - concave: Corvus frugilegus;

12.b the shape of the troclea metatarsi II.:

- with cut-off end: Corvus frugilegus, Pica;
- with rounded end: Corvus corax, C. monedula, Garrulus, Nucifraga;
- conical: Corvus corone, Pyrrhocorax;

12.c the shape of the trochlea metatarsi III.:

- symmetrical shaped: Corvus, Garrulus, Pica, Pyrrhocorax;
- asymmetrical shaped: Nucifraga;

12.d the shape of the trochlea metatarsi IV.:

- conical: Corvus frugilegus, Nucifraga;
- blunt cone: Corvus corone, Corvus monedula, Garrulus, Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax;
- asymmetrically: Corvus corax, Pica, Pyrrhocorax graculus;

13. Phalanx ungularis (Figure 16)

Knowing that there are four claws on one leg and they are different, I do not give a detailed description.



Figure 14. Left tibiotarsus (cranial aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

14. ábra Bal oldali lábszárcsont (dorzális nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax



Figure 15. Right *tarsometatarsus* (dorsal aspect): 1. *Corvus corax*; 2. *C. corone cornix*; 3. *C. frugilegus*; 4. *C. monedula*; 5. *Pica pica*; 6. *Garrulus glandarius*; 7. *Nucifraga caryocatactes*; 8. *Pyrrhocorax graculus*; 9. *Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax*

15. ábra Jobb oldali csüd (háti nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Garrulus glandarius; 7. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 8. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 9. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax



Figure 16. Phalanx ungualis (lateral aspect): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 7. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 8. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

16. ábra Karomcsont (oldalsó nézet): 1. Corvus corax; 2. C. corone cornix; 3. C. frugilegus; 4. C. monedula; 5. Pica pica; 6. Nucifraga caryocatactes; 7. Pyrrhocorax graculus; 8. Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax

Systematics

Fam. Corvidae (Vigors, 1825) (Table 1-6)

Corvids are the largest songbirds in Europe, hence they are unmistakable with any other members of songbird families. They live from plains to snowy mountains. They have sedentary, as well as migratory, species. They nest in crevices of rocks or on trees. They are omnivores. Their species shift occurred mainly in the Pleistocene. They are well represented in fossilized materials both in species and in numbers. This is not only due to their large population, seasonal constancy and relatively slower flight, but mostly due to their remains that are large enough to be detected via traditional collection methods.

- Corvus Linnaeus, 1758

- Corvus † pliocaenus (Portis, 1889) / syn. C. †betfianus Kretzoi, 1962; (Table 1)

Site and era: Polgárdi, Upper Miocene (MN 13) (Hungary) (Kessler 2010); Beremend 26, Lower Pliocene (MN 15) (Kessler 2010); Beremend 15, 18, Upper Pliocene (MN 16) (Jánossy 1992, 1996); Q1: Beremend 16, 17 (Jánossy 1992, 1996) (all in Hungary); Betfia 9 (Gál 2002) (Romania); Q2: Betfia "Aven" (Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002), Betfia 5 (Kretzoi 1962, Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002) (all in Romania); Q3: Tarkő 2 (Jánossy 1979) (Hungary). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin Q1-2: Czech Republic, France, Germany, Spain; Q3: France (Tyrberg 1998).

We described a similar species, *Corvus simionescui* (Kessler, 1979) (Mălușteni-Berești, Romania, Lower Pliocene, MN 15) next to the Carpathian Basin, Mlíkovský (2002) classified it to the recent *Corvus corone* species as well.

A common characteristic of taxa described with different names is that they range in size between crows and ravens. Mlikovský (2002) classifies certain taxa (*C. antecorax, C. pliocaenus janossyi*) to ravens, while others (*Corvus pliocaenus, C. betfianus*) to the recent Hooded Crow (*C. corone*). In our opinion, it is a transitional species that had gone extinct in the Middle Pleistocene. Due to the age and dimensions of the finds, we deem the species Corvus pliocaenus as valid. This is the oldest corvid of this size in Europe.

– *Corvus* † *hungaricus* Lambrecht, 1916 /syn. *C. antecorax* Mourer-Chauviré, 1975; *C. pliocaenus janossyi* Mourer-Chauviré, 1975

Site and era: Q1: Beremend 17 (Kessler 2010), Nagyharsányhegy 2 (all in Hungary) (Lambrecht 1916, Kessler 2010).

Material: distal end of right *humerus*, right *tarsometatarsus* (as holotype) (Nagyharsányhegy); distal end of *humerus*, 2 proximal end of *carpometacarpus*, proximal end of *femur*, 3 fragments of *tarsometatarsus* (1 proximale, 2 distale), (Beremend 17).

Dimensions: *tarsometarsus* A = 67 mm, C = 10 and 11.29 mm, E = 4.0 and 4.51, 4.27 mm, F = 8.67 and 7.94 mm, G = 5.26 and 4.56 mm; humerus C = 18.69 mm, D = 10.08 mm, F = 13.5 mm; *carpometacarpus* C = 12.68 and 12.36 mm, D = 6.91 and 6.94 mm.

It is a corvid with a lean skeleton and a size between crows and ravens. Mlikovský (2002) suggests reevaluation of the taxon, which we conducted, and the results confirmed the original diagnosis. In addition, we found the proximal fragment of a humerus as well at the site

of Nagyharsány mountain. Its identification from Beremend also confirms the reality of the taxon, and since other raven-sized species known from the fossilized and recent avian fauna of Europe were described later, we suggest keeping the taxon based on the principal of priority as well.

From Late Pliocene – Early Pleistocene and Middle Pleistocene of France (Senéze, Saint-Estéve-Janson, Lunel Viel, MN 17-18, **Q2** and **Q3**) the *Corvus antecorax* (Mourer-Chauviré, 1975) and *Corvus pliocaenus janossyi* (Mourer-Chauviré, 1975) finds of similar sizes are known (Mourer-Chauviré 1975).

- Corvus † harkanyensis Kessler, 2010

Site and era: Csarnóta 2, Upper Pliocene (MN 15-16) (Hungary) (Kessler 2010).

Material: distal end of right *humeus* – as holotype; distal end of left *tibiotarsus* – as paratype. Dimensions: *humerus*: E = 4.90 mm; F = 11.53 mm; G = 5.89 mm; H = 6.20 mm; *tibiotarsus* E = 3.10 mm; F = 5.60 mm; G = 5.71 mm;



Figure 17. Corvus harkanyensis Kessler, 2010 – A. distal end of right humerus (holotype): a. tuberculum supracondylare ventrale; b. processus flexorius; c. condylus dorsalis; d. condylus ventralis; e. epicondylus ventralis; f. processus supracondylaris dorsalis; B. distal end of left tibiotarsus (paratype): a. tuberculum retinaculum musculi fibularis; b. sulcus extensorius; c. pons tendineus; d. epicondylus lateralis; e. incisura intercondylaris; f. epicondylus medialis

17. ábra Corvus harkanyensis Kessler, 2010 – A jobb oldali felkarcsont disztális vége (holotípus): a. tuberculum supracondylare ventrale; b. processus flexorius; c. condylus dorsalis; d. condylus ventralis; e. epicondylus ventralis; f. processus supracondylaris dorsalis; B. bal oldali lábszárcsont disztális vége (paratípus): a. tuberculum retinaculum musculi fibularis; b. sulcus extensorius; c. pons tendineus; d. epicondylus lateralis; e. incisura intercondylaris; f. epicondylus medialis

J. Kessler

A corvid with the size of a Jackdaw, at the distal epiphysis of which in cranial view (*Figure 17A*) the tuberculum supracondylare ventrale (a) is more prominent than the present *Corvus* species, the *condylus ventralis* (c) is not ovoid but round in shape, the *epicondy-lus ventralis* (e), though damaged, is much wider and stouter, the *processus flexorius* (b) is curled up. On the distal end of the tibiotarsus (*Figure 17B*), in cranial view the end of the *sulcus extensorius* (c) above the *pons supratendineus* (b) is not rounded but has a pointed end (Kessler 2010).

Its name stems from the nearby town of Harkány. The fossilized species bearing characteristics and dimensions of the recent jackdaw was probably the ancestor of the form we see today in the Carpathian Basin.

Smaller *Corvus* species are only known from the Upper Pliocene (*C. cf. monedula*: Văršec Bulgária, MN 17; Boev 1995, 2000) among the avian fauna of Europe. From the Carpathian Basin and its immediate vicinity from the early Pleistocene of Stránská skála, Czech Republic, from where the *Corvus moravicus* (Mlikovskỳ 1995) extinct species was described, but the person describing it subsequently revoked it and reclassified the material as *C. monedula* (Mlikovskỳ 2002). The latter had been identified from several Middle and Upper Pleistocene sites (Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002).

- Corvus monedula Linnaeus, 1758 / syn. Corvus cf. † moravicus Mlíkovský, 1996

O1: Betfia 2, 9 (Kormos 1913, Čapek 1917, Lambrecht 1933, Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002); Q1-2: Betfia "Aven" (Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002) (all in Romania); Q2: Nagyharsányhegy 1-4 (Lambrecht 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979) (Hungary); Q3: Vindija (M. Malez 1961, M. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988) (Croatia); Q4/I: Merkenstein (Wettstein & Mühlhofer 1938), Mixnitz – Drachenhöhle (Lambrecht 1933) (all in Austria); Velika Pecina (V. Malez 1984, 1986, 1988) (Croatia); Bajót-Baits Cave, Bajót-Hóman Cave (Jánossy 1979), Csákvár-Eszterházy Cave (Lambrecht 1933, Kretzoi 1954, Jánossy 1979), Felsőtárkány-Peskő Cave (Lambrecht 1912, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Hámor-Puskaporos Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Pilisszántói I. Cave (Lambrecht 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Szilvásvárad-Istállóskői Cave (Lambrecht 1912, 1933, Jánossy 1952, 1955, 1979, 1986), Tata-Kálváriahegy no. 4. Cave (Gál 2004, 2005b), Tokod-Nagyberek (Jánossy 1979) (all in Hungary); Homoródalmási-Orbán Balázs Cave (Vîrghis-Pestera Mare) (Kessler 1977, Gál 2002), Körösmart (Rîpa), (Jánossy in Hamar & Csák 1969, Kessler 1974b, Gál 2002), Nándor-Nándori Cave (Nandru-Pestera Curata) (Jánossy 1965, Fischer & Stephan 1977, Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003), Ohábaponor-Bordu Mare Cave (Ohaba Ponor-Pestera Bordu Mare) (Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003) (all in Romania); O4/ II: Bodajk-Rigólyuk (Kordos 1984), Budapest-Sas György Place, Csepel Vízművek (Gál 2015), Csákvár-Esterházy Cave (Kretzoi 1954), Felsőtárkány-Petényi Cave (Jánossy 1979), Legény-Cave (Lambrecht 1914), Szendrő-Felsővár (Gál 2015), Széchény (Gál 2015), Székesfehérvár-Sziget (Gál 2015) (all in Hungary); Bégakalodva (Cladova) (Gál 2004), Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Pestera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a, Fischer & Stephan 1977), Kisbács-Bácsitorok (Baciu, Gura Baciului) (Kessler 2013a), Körösbánlaki Cave (Peştera din Bălnaca) (Kessler 1982), Peterd-Tordai-Hasadék-Magyar Cave (Petreşti, Cheile Turzii-Peştera Ungurească) (Kessler & Gál 1998, Gál 2004), Remetelórév-Bólyikői Cave (Lorău-Peştera din Piatra Boiului) (Kessler 1982); Révi caves (Peşterile din Vadu Crișului) (Kessler 1982), Székelykeresztúr (Cristuru-Secuiesc) (Gál 2008, 2015), Szkerisoara-Sasok Cave (Scărişoara, Peştera Vulturilor) (Kessler 1982, Jurcsák & Kessler 1986, 1988), Vársonkolyos-Izbîndiş Cave, Vársonkolyos-Kis Magyar Cave (Şuncuiuş, Peştera Izbîndiş; Peştera Napiştileu) (Kessler 1977, Gál 2002) (all in Romania). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin **Q1-2:** Bulgaria, Czech Republic, France, Ukraine; **Q3:** Czech Republic, France, Germany, Spain, Ukraine; **Q4:** Austria, Belgium, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Germay, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Montenegro, Moldova, Poland, Portugalia, Russia, Schwitzerland, Spain, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

[Note: Gál (2002) identifies the species as *C.* \dagger moravicus from the Betfia 9 site, but Mlikovskỳ (2002) reclassifies the fossil taxon as *C. monedula* based on the Corvidae size database published by Kessler and Moldvai (1993). We find it necessary to distinguish between present jackdaws from the Upper Pliocene-Lower Pleistocene and Upper Pleistocene at least on a subspecies level, named *C. monedula* \dagger moravicus.]

- Corvus corax Linnaeus, 1758

Q3/I: Hundsheim (Mlikovský 2009) (Austria); Q3/II: Vindija (M. Malez 1961, M. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988, Musil 1980) (Croatia); O4/I: Velika Pecina (M. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1984, 1986, 1988) (Croatia); Bajót-Baits Cave, Bajót-Jankovich Cave (Jánossy 1979a, 1979b); Budapest-Remetehegyi Cave (Kormos 1914, Lambrecht 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Felsőtárkány-Peskő-Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Hámor-Puskaporos Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Kesztölc-Bivak Cave (Jánossy 1979), Pilisszántói I. Cave Lambrecht 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Répáshuta-Balla Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933), Tatabánya-Szelim Cave (Jánossy 1979a, 1979b) (all in Hungary); Nándor-Nándori Cave (Nandru-Peştera Curata) (Jánossy 1965, Fischer & Stephan 1977, Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003), Ohábaponor-Bordu Mare Cave (Ohaba Ponor-Peştera Bordu Mare) (Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003) (all in Romania); Q4/II: Felsőnyék-Várhegy (Gál 2004, 2015), Felsőtárkány-Petényi Cave (Jánossy 1979), Mélyvölgy (Jánossy 1979), Pilisszentkereszt, Szendrő-Felsővár (Gál 2015) (all in Hungary), Kazánszoros-Climente Cave (Cazanele Mari-Peștera Climente I) (Kessler 1981, Gál 2002); Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Pestera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a, Fischer & Stephan 1977), Kazánszoros-Icoana Cave (Cazanele Mari, Pestera Icoana) (Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1986, 1988), Kovászna (Covasna) (Bindea 2008), Körösbánlaki Cave (Peştera din Bălnaca) (Kessler 1982) (all in Romania). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin Q1-2: Greece; Q3: Azerbaijan, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Ukraine; Q4: Armenia, Austria, Belgium, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Germany, Greece, Italy, Montenegro, Moldova, Norway, Poland, Portugalia, Russia, Switzerland, Spain, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

- Corvus corone Linnaeus, 1758

Q3: Vindija (M. Malez 1961, M. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988, Musil 1980) (Croatia); O4/I: Budapest-Remetehegyi Cave (Kormos 1914, Lambrecht 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Szilvásvárad-Istállóskői Cave (Lambrecht 1912, 1933, Jánossy 1952, 1955, 1979, 1986), Varbó-Lambrecht Kálmán Cave (Jánossy 1964, 1979) (all in Hungary); Körösmart (Rîpa) (Jánossy in Hamar & Csák 1969, Kessler 1974b, Gál 2002), Ohábaponor-Bordu Mare Cave (Ohaba Ponor-Peştera Bordu Mare) (Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003), Rév-Pince Cave (Vadu Crișului, Peștera Pincelului) (Gál 2002) (all in Romania); Q4/II: Teufelslucke (Söergel 1966) (Austria); Bajcsa-Castle (Gál 2015), Balatonlelle-Kenderföldek (Gál 2005b), Felsővadász-Várdomb, Hajdúnánás (Gál 2015), Nagysomlyói Fosse (Kessler 2010) (all in Hungary); Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Pestera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a, Fischer & Stephan 1977), Körösbánlaki-Cave (Pestera din Bălnaca) (Kessler 1982), Peterd-Tordai-hasadék – Magyar Cave (Petresti, Cheile Turzii-Pestera Ungurească) (Kessler & Gál 1998, Gál 2005a), Remetelórév-Bólyikői Cave (Lorău-Pestera din Piatra Boiului) (Kessler 1982), Révi caves (Pesterile din Vadu Crisului) (Kessler 1982), Szkerisoara-Sasok Cave (Scărisoara, Peștera Vulturilor) (Kessler 1982, Jurcsák & Kessler 1986, 1988), Vársonkolvos-Kis Magyar Cave, Vársonkolvosi caves (Suncuius-Pestera Napisteleu-Pesterile din Suncuius) (Kessler 1977, Gál 2002) (all in Romania); Padina (Classon 1980, Gál 2004) (Serbia). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin **O3:** Azerbaijan, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Germany, Greece, Spain; Q4: Austria, Belgium, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Germany, Italy, Malta, Portugalia, Russia, Switzerland, Spain, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

- Corvus frugilegus Linnaeus, 1758

Q4/I: Felsőtárkány-Peskő Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Pilisszántói I. Cave (Lambrecht 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986) (all in Hungary); Q4/II: Bajcsa-Castle (Gál 2002, 2015), Balatonkeresztúr-Réti dűlő (Gál 2004), Bodajk-Rigólyuk (Kordos 1984), Endrőd 39 (Gál 2005a), Pilismarót-Malompatak (Jánossy 1985), Széchény (Gál 2015), Szendrő (Gál 2005b, Tassi 2006), Tác-Gorsium (Bökönyi 1984, Jánossy 1985), Visegrád-Palace (Gál 2015) (all in Hungary); Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Peştera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a, Fischer & Stephan 1977), Körösbánlaki Cave (Peştera din Bălnaca) (Kessler 1982), Vársonkolyosi caves (Kessler 1977, Gál 2002) (Şuncuiuş-Peşterile din Şuncuiuş) (all in Romania); Padina (Classon 1980, Gál 2004) (Serbia). Q3: Azerbaijan, Germany, Greece; Q4: Belgium, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, France, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Netherlands, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

- Corvus corone/frugilegus

Q4/II: Kaposújlak-Várdomb, Paks-Gyapa, Dombóvár-Tesco (Gál 2017);

[Note: there are only very small morphological differences between the skeletal parts of the Hooded Crow *(Corvus corone cornix)* and the Rook *(C. frugilegus)*, but the bones of the former species are slightly more robust. Incidentally, the subspecies – Carrion Crow, which is widespread in the western and southern parts of Europe, is also pure black, like the

juvenile crow. The latter is rarely reported from fossil finds, probably because of the great similarity. Presumably, it occurs in many materials because the two species could not be separated. All indications are that a separation of the two species may have occurred recently, probably in the Holocene.]

- Corvus sp. foss. indet.

Site and era: Litke 2 (MN 5) (Kessler & Hír 2011), Polgárdi 4 (MN 13) (Jánossy 1991, 1995), Beremend 26 (MN 15) (Kessler 2010), Villány 3 (MN 16) (Kessler 2010) (all in Hungary).

[Note: material from the Neogene mostly consists of claws. Claws of corvids have a typical shape, but since there is a size difference between the four claws, and those belonging to species of more or less similar sizes cannot be reliably distinguished, we can only classify them to the genus level.]

- Corvus sp. indet.

Q1: Villány 5 (Kessler 2010), Beremend 17 (Jánossy 1991, 1992) (all in Hungary); **Q4/I:** Szárazgerence (Jánossy 1979, 1986), Varbó-Lambrecht Kálmán Cave (Jánossy 1964, 1979) (all in Hungary), Detrekőszentmiklós-Pálffy Cave (Dzeráva Skála-Plavecky Mikulas) (Lambrecht 1913, 1933) (Slovakia); **Q4/II:** Ecsegfalva (Pike-Tay *et al.* 2004, Gál 2007), Tatabánya-alsó – Törekvés Cave (Kessler 2010), Maroslele-Pana (Bökönyi 1964, Jánossy 1979, 1985, Gál 2005a, 2005b), Szolnok-Szanda (Jánossy 1985, Gál 2005a, 2005b) (all in Hungary).

Spread: From the Late Pliocene of Spain and Bulgaria (Puebla de Valverde, as well as Slivnica, MN 17-18) *Corvus* finds described to the genus level are known from the Neogene of Europe (Mlíkovský 2002).

- † Miocorvus Lambrecht 1933

- Miocorvus † larteti (Milne-Edwards, 1871)

Site and era: Tasádfő (Tăşad, Romania), Middle Miocene (MN 7) (Gál & Kessler 2006, Kessler 2010); Mátraszőlős 3, Middle Miocene (MN 7/8); Rudabánya, Upper Miocene (MN 9) (Kessler 2010, Kessler & Hír 2012); Polgárdi 4, Upper Miocene (MN 13); Csarnóta 2, Beremend 26, Lower Pliocene (MN 15) (Kessler 2010) (all in Hungary).

Material: distal end of *humerus* (Mátraszőlős 3), distal end of *carpometacarpus*, *phalanx 1. digiti II. alae* (Csarnóta 2), 4 distal fragments of *tibiotarsus* (Rudabánya 3, Polgárdi 4, Beremend 26), 4 *phal. pedis* (Tasádfő).

Dimensions: *humerus* F = 10.11 mm; *carpometacarpus* F = 5.6 mm, G = 3.3 mm; *phal. alae* C = 3.36 mm, E = 4.69 mm, F = 3.43 mm; *tibiotarsus* E=2.49, 2.80 and 2.92 mm, F=5.44, 5.51, 5.65 and 5.78 mm, G=5.72 and 6.89 mm; *tarsometatarsus* F = 5.6 mm, G = 3.3 mm.

The small (jay-sized) crow described by Milne-Edwards (*Corvus larteti* Milne-Edwards, 1871) was renamed by Lambrecht (1933). We classified the material described by Jánossy (1979, 1997) from the Csarnóta 2 site here as well, but this is highly questionable due to the age difference.

Outside of the typical site (the Middle Miocene of France) (Sansan, MN 6) (Milne-Edwards 1871), it was also reported in 2006 from the Middle Miocene of Tășad, Romania (MN 7) (Kessler & Venczel 2009) and the Middle Miocene of Dobrogea as well, also in Romania (Credința, MN 8) (Gál & Kessler 2006).

- Garrulus Vieillot, 1816

- Garrulus glandarius (Linnaeus, 1758)

O1: Németóvár 4B (Deutsch-Altenburg, Austria) (Jánossy 1981), Beremend 17 (O1) (Jánossy 1992) (Hungary); Betfia 2, 9 (Kormos 1913, Čapek 1917, Lambrecht 1933, Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002) (Romania); O1-2: Betfia "Aven" (Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002), Kiskóh-Medvék Cave (Chiscău-Pestera Ursilor) (Kessler 1982) (all in Romania); Q3/I: Hundsheim (Mlíkovský 1998, 2002) (Austria); Vindija (M. Malez 1961, V. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988, Musil 1980) (Croatia); Q4/I: Mixnitz-Drachenhöhle (Lambrecht 1933) (Austria); Krapina, Velika Pecina, Veternica (V. Malez 1973, 1984, 1986, 1988, V. Malez-Bačić 1979) (all in Croatia); Bajót-Baits Cave, Bajót-Hóman Cave (Jánossy 1979), Budapest-Remetehegyi Cave (Kormos 1914, Lambrecht 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Felsőtárkány-Peskő Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Hámor-Puskaporos Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Pilisszántói I. Cave (Lambrecht 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Szilvásvárad-Istállóskői Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1952, 1955, 1979, 1986), Varbó-Lambrecht Kálmán-Cave (Jánossy 1964, 1979) (all in Hungary); Hidegszamos-Csont Cave (Someşul Rece) (Lambrecht 1915), Ohábaponor-Bordu Mare Cave (Ohaba Ponor-Pestera Bordu Mare) (Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003) (all in Romania); Q4/II: Balatonkeresztúr-Réti dűlő (Gál 2004, 2015), Ecsegfalva (Pike-Tay et al. 2004, Gál 2007), Felsőtárkány-Petényi Cave (Jánossy 1979), Legény Cave (Kormos 1914), Miskolc-Felső-forrás, Anonym Cave (Kessler 2010), Rezi (Kessler 2009), Tatabánya-alsó – Törekvés Cave (Kessler 2010), Vác-Széchenyi street, Visegrád-Várkert (Gál 2015) (all in Hungary); Remetelórév-Bólyikői Cave (Lorău-Pestera din Piatra Boiului) (Kessler 1982), Révi caves (Pesterile din Vadu Crisului) (Kessler 1982), Szegyestel-Drăcoiaia Cave (Sighiştel, Peştera Drăcoaia) (Kessler 1982); Székelykeresztúr (Cristuru-Secuiesc) (Gál 2008, 2015), Vársonkolyos-Kis Magyar Cave (Şuncuiuş, Peştera Napiştileu) (Kessler 1977, Gál 2002) (all in Romania). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin Q1-2: France, Germany; Q3: Czech Republic, France, Germany, Italy, Ukraine, United Kingdom; **Q4:** Austria, Belgium, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Germany, Greece, Ireland, Italy, Luxemburg, Moldova, Poland, Portugalia, Russia, Spain, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

- Nucifraga Vieillot, 1816

- Nucifraga caryocatactes Linnaeus, 1758

Q1: Betfia 9 (Gál 2002) (Romania); Q3: Vindija (M. Malez 1961, M. Malez & Rukavina 1979, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988, Musil 1980) (Croatia); Q4/I: Merkenstein (Wettstein & Mühlhofer 1938), Mixnitz-Drachenhöhle (Lambrecht 1933) (Austria); Bajót-Öregkő (Kormos 1914), Balla-Cave, Budapest-Remetehegyi Cave (Kormos 1914, Lambrecht 1933,

Jánossy 1979, 1986), Felsőtárkány-Peskő Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Galgóc (Lambrecht 1915, 1933), Hámor-Puskaporos Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Pilisszántói I. Cave (Lambrecht 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986) (all in Hungary); Barcarozsnyó (Pestera Gura Cheii-Râșnov) (Gál 1998, 2002), Szegyestel-Măgura Cave (Sighiştel, Peştera Măgura) (Kessler 1982, 1985, Gál 2002) (all in Romania); Detrekőszentmiklós-Pálffy Cave (Dzeráva Skála-Plavecky Mikulas) (Lambrecht 1913, 1933) (Slovakia); Q4/II: Teufelslucke (Soergel 1966) (Austria); Felsőtárkány-Petényi Cave (Jánossy 1979) (Hungary); Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Pestera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a Fischer & Stephan 1977), Révi caves (Pesterile din Vadu Crisului) (Kessler 1982), Szkerisoara-Coiba Mare Cave (Scărisoara, Pestera Coiba Mare) (Kessler 1982), Jurcsák & Kessler 1986, 1988), Vársonkolvos-Izbîndis Cave, Vársonkolyos-Kis Magyar Cave (Şuncuiuş, Peştera Izbîndiş, Peştera Napiştileu) (Kessler 1977, Gál 2002) (all in Romania). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin Q1-2: Spain; Q3: Czech Republic, France, Germany, Italy, Ukraine; Q4: Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Germany, Italy, Poland, Portugalia, Russia, Switzerland, Spain (Tyrberg 1998).

- Pica (Linnaeus, 1758)

- Pica pica † major Jánossy, 1979 (Table 2)

Site and era: **MN 15:** Beremend 26 (Kessler 2010), Csarnóta 2 (Jánossy 1979, Kessler 2010) (all in Hungary); **Q1:** Beremend 16, 17 (Jánossy 1992) (Hungary); Betfia 2, 9 (Kormos 1913, Čapek 1917, Lambrecht 1933, Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002) (all in Romania); **Q2:** Betfia "Aven" (Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1977, 1979, Gál 2002) (Romania); **Q2:** Nagyharsányhegy 1-4 (Lambrecht 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979) (Hungary); **Q3/I:** Hundsheim (Lambrecht 1933, Jánossy 1979) (Austria); Dorog-Hungáriahegy (Jánossy 1953, 1986, Jánossy & Vörös 1987), Vértesszőlős 2 (Jánossy 1979, 1990) (all in Hungary).

Mlikovský (2002) classifies the fossil magpie species to the recent Western Jackdaw (*Corvus monedula*) based on the material from Stránská Skála classified by Jánossy (1972). When examining the fossilized material, we determined that this does not apply to the material from the Carpathian Basin, as the dimensional and morphological characteristics both refute this. Based on examination of the Csarnóta 2, Beremend 26 and numerous Lower Pleistocene materials, the validity of the fossilized subspecies is evident. The magpie characteristics, as well as the larger sizes than that of the present species, can be clearly shown. The present species is only known from the Middle Pleistocene of Europe, and is probably the direct descendant of the fossil subspecies.

Mourer-Chauviré (1975) also describes the fossil subspecies (*Pica pica major*) from the Middle Pleistocene (Saint-Estéve Janson, Lunel Viel, Q3), while the present species is only known from the Upper Pleistocene. Another magpie find described to the genus level (*Pica* sp.) is known from the late Pliocene of Bulgaria (Văršec MN 17) (Mlikovskỳ 2002).

- Pica pica (Linnaeus, 1758)

Q3/II: Vindija (M. Malez 1961, M. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988, Musil 1980) (Croatia); **Q4/I:** Mixnitz-Drachenhöhle (Lambrecht 1933) (Austria);

Bajót-Öregkő (Lambrecht 1914), Budapest-Remetehegyi Cave (Kormos 1914, Lambrecht 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Cserépfalu-Subalyuk Cave (Jánossy 1979); Felsőtárkány-Peskő Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1979a, 1986), Hámor-Puskaporos Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Kesztölc-Bivak Cave (Jánossy 1979), Pilisszántói I. Cave (Lambrecht 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Répáshuta-Balla Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933), Szilvásvárad-Istállóskői Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1952, 1955, 1979, 1986), Tatabánya-Kálváriahegy Cave no. 4. (Gál 2004, 2005b), Varbó-Lambrecht Kálmán Cave (Jánossy 1964, 1979) (all in Hungary); Körösmart (Rîpa) (Jánossy in Hamar & Csák 1969, Kessler 1974b, Gál 2002), Ohábaponor-Bordu Mare Cave (Ohaba Ponor-Pestera Bordu Mare) (Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003) (all in Romania); O4/II: Teufelslucke (Soergel 1966) (Austria); Budapest-Sas György square – Teleki Palace (Gál 2015), Ecsegfalva (Pike-Tay et al. 2004, Gál 2007), Felsőtárkány-Petényi Cave (Jánossy 1979), Ludas-Budzsák (Bökönyi 1974, Gál 2005a), Pilismarót-Malompatak (Jánossy 1985) (all in Hungary); Bégakalodva (Cladova) (Gál 2005a), Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Pestera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a, Fischer & Stephan 1977), Körösbánlaki Cave (Pestera din Bălnaca) (Kessler 1982), Remetelórév-Bólyikői Cave (Lorău-Peștera din Piatra Boiului) (Kessler 1982), Révi Cave (Pesterile din Vadu Crisului) (Kessler 1982), Vársonkolvosi caves (Pesterile din Suncuius) (Kessler 1977, Gál 2002) (all in Romania). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin **Q1-2**: Spain; **Q3**: Azerbaijan, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Germany, Italy, Spain, Ukraine: O4: Austria, Belgium, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Germany, Ireland, Italy, Montenegro, Moldova, Poland, Portugalia, Russia, Switzerland, Spain, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

- Pyrrhocorax Vieillot, 1816

- Pyrrhocorax graculus † vetus Kretzoi, 1962 (Table 3)

Site and era: **MN 15**: Beremend 26 (Kessler 2010), Csarnóta 2 (Jánossy 1972) (all in Hungary); **MN 16**: Villány 3 (Kessler 2010 as *Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax*) (Hungary); **Q1**: Beremend 17 (Jánossy 1991, 1992) (Hungary); Betfia 2, 9 (Kormos 1913, Čapek 1917, Lambrecht 1933, Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002) (Romania); **Q1-2**: Betfia "Aven" (Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002) (Romania); **Q2**: Betfia 5 (Kretzoi 1962, Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002) (Romania); **Q2**: Betfia 5 (Kretzoi 1962, Kessler 1975, Jánossy 1979, Gál 2002), Kiskóh-Medvék-Cave 2 (Chişcău-Peştera Urşilor) (Kessler 1982, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002) (all in Romania); Méhész (Vcelare) (Jánossy 1979) (Slovakia); **Q3/I**: Hundsheim (Lambrecht 1933, Jánossy 1979, Mlikovský 1998, 2002) (Austria); Tarkő 3, 4 (Jánossy 1979) (Hungary); Gombaszög (Gombasek) (Kessler 2009) (Slovakia).

Mlikovský (2002) classified the subspecies with different sizes and especially ratios to those of the present alpine chough. This is countered by the facts that on the one hand, the differences indicated by the diagnosis are clearly visible, and on the other hand, its subsequent characteristics can be associated with much earlier materials (Csarnóta 2, Beremend 17, and numerous other Lower and Middle Pleistocene sites). All this supports our opinion that this is a fossil subspecies, as well as the direct ancestor, of the present species.

- Pyrrhocorax graculus (Linnaeus, 1766)

Q3/II: Vindija (M. Malez 1961, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988, M. Malez & Rukavina 1979, Musil 1980) (Croatia); O4/I: Merkenstein (Wettstein & Mühlhofer 1938), Mixnitz-Drachenhöhle (Lambrecht 1933) (all in Austria); Velika Pecina (M. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1984, 1988) (Croatia); Bajót-Öregkő (Kormos 1914), Bajót-Hóman Cave (Jánossy 1979), Budapest-Remetehegyi Cave (Kormos 1914, Lambrecht 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Cserépfalu-Subalyuk Cave (Jánossy 1979); Csobánka-Kiskevélyi Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979), Kesztölc-Bivak Cave (Jánossy 1979), Pilisszántói I. Cave (Lambrecht 1915, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Szilvásvárad-Istállóskői Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1952, 1955, 1979, 1986), Vaskapu Cave (Mottl 1941) (all in Hungary); Barcarozsnyó (Gura Cheii-Cave, Râsnov) (Gál 1998, 2002), Hidegszamos-Csont Cave (Pestera cu Oase, Somesul Rece) (Lambrecht 1915), Măgura-Valea Coacazei Cave (Măgura-Peștera din Valea Coacăzei) (Gál 2002), Nándor-Nándori Cave (Nandru-Peștera Curata) (Jánossy 1965, Fischer & Stephan 1977, Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003), Ohábaponor-Bordu Mare Cave (Ohaba Ponor-Peștera Bordu Mare) (Kessler 1985, Jurcsák & Kessler 1988, Gál 2002, 2003), Peterd-Tordai-hasadék - Binder Cave (Cheile Turzii-Peștera Binder) (Kessler 1985, Gál 2002) (all in Romania); Q4/II: Knochenhöhle (Bocheński & Tomek 1994), Grosse Offenbergerhöhle (Bocheński & Tomek 1994), Hohlensteinhöhle (Bocheński & Tomek 1994), Tropfsteinhöhle, Tunnelhöhle (Fladerer 1993) (all in Austria); Felsőtárkány-Petényi Cave (Jánossy 1979), Hosszúhegyi Cave (Jánossy 1979b) (all in Hungary); Herkulesfürdő-Rablók Cave (Băile Herculane, Peştera Hoților) (Kessler 1981, Gál 2002), Kazánszoros-Climente Cave (Cazanele Mari, Peștera Climente I) (Kessler 1981, Gál 2002), Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Peştera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a, Fischer & Stephan 1977) (all in Romania). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin Q1-2: Bulgaria, Spain, Ukraine; Q3: Azerbaijan, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Germany, Spain, Ukraine; Q4: Austria, Bulgaria, Croatia, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Germany, Greece, Italy, Montenegro, Poland, Russia, Switzerland, Spain, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

The present species is also known from the Late Pliocene of Bulgaria and Spain (Văršec and Meda Gran, MN 17) – these, however, supposedly belong to the fossil subspecies above – as well as from numerous sites in France and a few in Greece from the Lower and Middle Pleistocene. It can nowadays be found in the Alps, Pyrenees and the Balkan Peninsula (as well as the Upper Pleistocene and Holocene sediments of the caves located there) (Mli-kovskỳ 2002).

- Pyrrhocorax pyrrhocorax (Linnaeus, 1758)

Q2: Nagyharsányhegy 1-4 (Kessler 2010) (Hungary); Q3/I: Hundsheim (Mlikovský 2009) (Austria); Q3/II: Vindija (M. Malez 1961, M. Malez & Rukavina 1975, V. Malez 1973, 1986, 1988, Musil 1980) (Croatia); Solymár-Ördöglyuk (Jánossy 1979) (Hungary); Q4/I: Luegloch (Mottl 1953) (Austria); Felsőtárkány-Peskő Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Hámor-Puskaporos Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1916, 1933, Jánossy 1979, 1986), Répáshuta-Balla Cave (Lambrecht 1912a, 1912b, 1933) (all in Hungary); Körösmart (Rîpa) (Jánossy in Hamar & Csák 1969, Kessler 1974b, Gál

2002), Rév-Pince Cave (Vadu Crișului, Peștera Pincelului) (Gál 2002) (all in Romania); **Q4**/ **II:** Grosse Offenbergerhöhle (Bocheński & Tomek 1994) (Austria); Kazánszoros-Töröklik Cave (Cazanele Mari, Peștera Cuina Turcului) (Kessler 1974a, Fischer & Stephan 1977) (Romania). From sites in Europe outside the Carpathian Basin **Q1-2:** Spain, Ukraine; **Q3:** Azerbaijan, Czech Republic, France, Georgia, Spain, Ukraine; **Q4:** Austria, Bosnia-Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, France, Georgia, Greece, Italy, Luxemburg, Portugalia, Romania, Russia, Switzerland, Spain, Ukraine, United Kingdom (Tyrberg 1998).

- Perisorius Bonaparte, 1831
- Perisorius infaustus Bonaparte, 1831 Q4/I: Répáshuta-Balla-Cave (Lambrecht 1912, 1933) (Hungary);
- Corvidae gen. et sp. foss. indet.
 MN 15: Beremend 26 (Kessler 2010: as *Nucifraga caryocatactes*) (Hungary);
- Corvidae gen. et sp. indet.

Q2: Ürömhegy (Jánossy 1961, 1986); **Q4/I:** Tatabánya-Kálvária no. 4. Cave (Gál 2004, 2005b) (all in Hungary);

Conclusions

From the introduction of Corvids and by listing their finds from the Neogene and the Quaternary, it became evident that although their fossil and subfossil remains are frequent at several sites, the number of species is relatively low, both regarding extinct and present taxa.

Their classification is made harder – as it became evident when discussing osteology – by the fact that there is a large amount of morphological homogeneity, and identifying them is often only aided by size differences. It is no coincidence that on this basis, Mlíkovsky (2002) classified numerous known extinct species to present taxa or synonymizes.

Acknowledgements

The author wishes to express his deep gratitude to Mihály Gasparik for access in recent bird bone collection in the Natural History Museum of Hungary, to referees for their help in the revision of the text and to József Vuts and Lóránd Abos for the language revision.

Table 1. Corvus † pliocaenus (Portis), 1889

1. táblázat Corvus † pliocaenus (Portis), 1889 tmt=tarsometatarsus; ph.a=phalanga 1. digiti II; ph. p.=phalanga pedis; ph.u.=phalanga unguis; x, xd=number of copies; A-G=see bone sizes) (Abbreviations: cor=coracoideum; scap=scapula; hum=humerus; rad=radius; cmcp=carpometacarpus; fem=femur; tib=tibiotarsus;

ph.a=*phalanga* 1. *digiti* ll; ph. p.=*phalanga pedis*; ph.u.=*phalanga unguis*; x, xd=pédányszám; A-G=lásd: csontméretek) (Röviditések: cor=coracoideum; scap=scapula; hum=humerus; rad=radius; cmcp=carpometacarpus; fem=femur; tib=tibiotarsus; tmt=tarsometatarsus;

Bones	Total length	Partial length	Breadth prox.end	Thicknes prox.end	Breadth of corpus	Breadth distal end	Thickness dist.end	Other sizes	Localities	Sou
coracoideum	44.00								Beremend 17	Jár
n	50.00								п	
carpometacarpus	61.00								п	
femur-exemplare	54.60-655.00								п	
scapula		12.06	6.33	6.65	5.37				Betfia 5	Ð
carpometacarpus						10.08			Betfia "Aven"	
и								E1=4.00	Betfia 5	
и			6.30						п	
tarsometatarsus					4.90				п	
coracoideum					4.65		11.38		Polgárdi 5	Kess
femur			11.26		5.11				и	
coracoideum					4.49				Beremend 17	
humerus					8.20	18.69	10.08		n	
carpometacarpus			12.36	6.94					n	
и			12.68	6.91					и	
femur			12.00	7.98					и	
ulna						11.42	8.01		Beremend 26	
femur					4.75	11.05	8.88		n	

Table 2. Pica pica † major Jánossy, 1979

2. táblázat Pica pica † major Jánossy, 1979 tmt=tarsometatarsus; ph.a=phalanga 1. digiti II; ph. p.=phalanga pedis; ph.u.=phalanga unguis; x, xd=number of copies; A-G=see bone sizes) (Abbreviations: cor=coracoideum; scap=scapula; hum=humerus; rad=radius; cmcp=carpometacarpus; fem=femur; tib=tibiotarsus;

ph.a=*phalanga* 1. *digiti* II; ph. p.=*phalanga pedis*; ph.u.=*phalanga unguis;* x, xd=példányszám; A-G=lásd: csontméretek) (Röviditések: cor=coracoideum; scap=scapula; hum=humerus; rad=radius; cmcp=carpometacarpus; fem=femur; tib=tibiotarsus; tmt=tarsometatarsus;

phalanga pedis	"	carpometacarpus	coracoideum	"	phalanga pedis	tibiotarsus	femur	phalanga 1. digiti II.	radius	ulna	scapula	"	"	coracoideum	humerus	Bones
12.50		34.22		9.00	6.70			3.43								Total length
3.78		29.69			2.55		7.54				6.26					Partial length
1.85		8.47	5.80		1.24		4.03	4.39		6.65	3.47				13.40	Breadth prox.end
3.10		4.27			1.71		3.51				4.44			cca.7.50		Thicknes prox.end
	cca. 7.00					3.50			1.81	3.21	3.04	2.35	2.13			Breadth of corpus
		5.47				5.52			4.48							Breadth distal end
		3.01				5.76			2.51							Thickness dist.end
	E1=3.10															Other sizes
		Baremend 26	Beremend 17											Csarnóta 2	Hundsheim	Localities
"	"	"		"	"	"	"	"	"	"	"	"	"	Kessler 2010	Jánossy 1979	Source

Table 3. Pyrrhocorax graculus †vetus Kretzoi, 1962

3. táblázat Pyrrhocorax graculus †vetus Kretzoi, 1962 tmt=tarsometatarsus; ph.a=phalanga 1. digiti II; ph. p.=phalanga pedis; ph.u.=phalanga unguis; x, xd=number of copies; A-G=see bone sizes) (Abbreviations: cor=coracoideum; scap=scapula; hum=humerus; rad=radius; cmcp=carpometacarpus; fem=femur; tib=tibiotarsus;

ph.a=phalanga 1. digiti II; ph. p.=phalanga pedis; ph.u.=phalanga unguis; x, xd=példányszám; A-G=lásd: csontméretek) (Röviditések: cor=coracoideum; scap=scapula; hum=humerus; rad=radius; cmcp=carpometacarpus; fem=femur; tib=tibiotarsus; tmt=tarsometatarsus;

tibiotarsus	"	femur	ulna	humerus	"	phalanga pedis	tarsometatarsus	"	tibiotarsus	ulna	coracoideum	tarsometatarsus	"	tibiotarsus	n	и	femur	radius	"	ulna	humerus	coracoideum	n	tibiotarsus	carpometacarpus	Bones
			59.85		9.50	10.00								65.20			37.81					31.45			36.20	Total length
			7.70		3.65	3.19											35.95				20.64	29.19			33.20	Partial length
		8.10	8.32		2.00	1.81								7.53			7.15	3.32			12.82	6.60				Breadth prox.end
		5.44	9.22		3.29	3.15							6.76	6.74			4.08	3.03				3.31				Thicknes prox.end
		3.65	4.27				2.80		3.00	3.87	2.75	2.53	3.00	3.45	3.30	3.40	3.20		3.65	4.16	4.70	2.90	3.28	3.15		Breadth of corpus
6.19	6.61		7.96	10.84				6.22		7.00				5.84		7.89	7.24		7.60	7.73			6.44	5.43	8.20	Breadth distal end
5.70	5.04		5.41	5.78				5.05		4.70	8.50			5.64		5.74	5.41		4.82	5.57			5.85	6.12		Thickness dist.end
																									E1=3.00	Other sizes
	"		Gombaszög	Kiskóh 1		Betfia 9	"				Betfia 2	=		п	и	н			"	и		н	и	"	Betfia "Aven"	Localities
			Kessler 2010		"	=			=				=	"	"	n				и		Gál 2002	"	u	Kretzoi 1862	Source

Bone (Figure 3–6)	Corvus corax	C. corone	C. frugilegus	C. monedula	Pica pica	Garrulus gland.	Nucifraga caryoc.	Pyrrhocorax gr.	P. pyrrhocorax
mandibula – A	96.00	70.00	72.00	51.00	49.00	49.00	65.00	53.00	
" – B	22.00	17.00	17.00	13.00	13.00	11.00	30.00	15.00	
" – C	14.00	11.00	10.00	11.00	9.00	8.00	13.00	10.00	
coracoideum – A	58.80	41.40-44.40	39.20-43.00	32.00-33.10	29.60-35.90	29.00-30.70	32.90	31,50-32.72	33.00-35.87
" – B	53.50	38.30-41.20	36.20-39.40	30.30-31.00	28.00-33.40	27.10-28.90	30.10	28.80-28.90	28.80-32.71
" – C	12.10	9.00-9.20	8.10-8.90	5.90-7.00	5.80-7.10	5.20	5.30	7.50	7.50
" – D	12.50	9.30-10.40	8.40-9.70	6.60–6.70	5.90-7.30	5.30-6.30	5.40	6.55-7.30	6.85-7.50
" – E	5.00	2.70-3.40	3.00-3.20	2.30-2.40	2.00-2.40	1.90-2.00	2.10-3.00	2.50	3.00
" – F	16.90	11.70-12.60	9.80-11.80	8.50–8.90	7.00–9.40	6.90-7.30	8.00	9.50-10.92	10.00-11.11
9 – "	14.50	12.00	10.00	8.70	8.00	6.50	7.00	9.52	9.62
scapula – A	64.80	47.20-50.00	43.40-48.40	34.90-35.50	35.80-40.60	34.00-36.00	36.00	38.00-40.36	42.00-42.17
" – B	16.10	10.60-11.80	10.20-11.30	7.70–8.30	6.50-9.00	6.80-7.20	7.00	9.00-9.23	9.50-10.00
" – C	8.20	5.20-5.30	4.40-5.40	3.70-4.00	3.40-4.30	3.20-3.30	3.90	3.70	3.70
" – D	9.30	5.90-6.60	5.20-6.30	3.90-4.30	4.30-4.80	4.60-4.70	4.40	5.51	5.21
" – E	6.10	4.00-4.50	3.70-4.00	2.70-2.90	2.60-3.60	2.50	2.40	3.50-4.00	3.63-4.00
humerus – A	93.00	60.20-67.00	60.50-64.60	41.40-48.80	40.60-49.20	39.00-42.10	40.20-42.40	41.60-45.60	53.44-54.30
" – B	37.00	25.20-26.00	23.50-25.40	17.70-18.80	16.60-20.00	15.40-17.10	17.00	19.00-21.33	21.97-22.00
" – C	26.40	18.00-18.40	16.20-19.00	12.80-15.40	12.20-14.00	11.3-13.2	12.20-12.80	12.50-14.07	14.74-16.00
" – D	25.50	17.40-17.70	16.00-18.80	12.40-13.20	12.20-14.00	10.40-12.20	12.00	14.16	15.34
" – E	8.50	6.00-6.30	5.30-6.00	4.10-4.60	3.80-4.90	3.40-4.10	3.50-3.80	4.60-5.18	5.205.50
- F	19.30	14.10-15.00	13.00-14.20	9.40-11.10	10.00-11.00	9.30-11.00	9.80-10.00	11.78-13.00	11.86-14.50
9 – "	11.30	7.80-8.60	7.80-8.20	5.4-6.10	5.40-6.80	4.40-5.00	4.80	6.17	6.22
"-Н	7.80	5.00	4.90	3.50	3.90	3.20	3.10	6.90	6.80

 Table 4.
 Corvidae – mandibula, coracoideum, scapula, humerus dimensions

 4. táblázat
 Varjúfélék – alsó állkapocs, hollócsőrcsont, lapocka, felkarcsont méretek

Table 5. Corvidae – ulr 5. táblázat Varjúfélék – si	na, radius, i ngcsont, c	<i>carpometacarp</i> orsócsont, kézk	us, phalanga 1. özépcsont, szái	<i>digiti</i> II. dimens rny 1. ujjperc, II.	ions ujj méretek				
Bone (Figure 7–10)	Corvus corax	C. corone	C. frugilegus	C. monedula	Pica pica	Garrulus gland.	Nucifraga caryoc.	Pyrrhocorax gr.	P. pyrrhocorax
ulna – A	112.40	76.50-81.40	73.00–79.80	56.70-58.20	51.00-61.30	48.00-50.30	49.80	57.00-59.09	66.67–68.00
<i>"</i> – B	13.80	9.20–9.80	8.40-9.90	6.80-7.10	6.40-7.40	6.20-6.30	6.20	7.87-8.00	8.30-9.00
" – C	15.80	10.00	9.10-10.70	6.80-8.20	6.80-8.90	6.70-7.10	7.00	8.20-8.47	8.69–9.50
" – E	6.70	4.80-5.00	4.40-5.00	3.20-3.50	3.00-3.70	3.00-3.40	3.10	4.00	4.29-4.50
<i>"</i> − F	12.80	9.10-9.40	8.30–9.50	6.40-6.60	6.90-7.20	5.70-6.00	6.20	7.00-7.82	8.129.00
9 – "	9.30	6.40–6.90	6.20–6.60	4.60-5.20	4.30-5.20	4.20-4.40	4.30	5.00-5.41	5.81
radius – A	102.00	69.40-73.80	67.30-73.00	51.00-54.00	45.40-55.00	42.80-44.40	44.70	51.00-53.70	60.26-62.00
" – C	5.80	3.90–4.70	3.40-4.10	3.00-3.10	2.80-3.70	2.80-3.10	3.00	3.50-4.08	3.89-5.00
" – D	4.40	3.20-3.70	3.00-3.40	2.30-2.40	2.20-2.80	2.20-2.30	2.60	2.81-2.90	2.81-3.50
" – E	3.40	2.00-2.40	1.80-2.00	1.40-1.50	1.30-1.60	1.30–1.50	1.50	1.60-1.90	1.58-2.00
- F	8.50	5.70-6.00	5.50-6.00	4.00-4.10	3.50-4.00	2.90-3.50	3.70	4.80-5.48	5.02
carpometacarpus – A	70.00	46.60-49.80	44.60-48.10	34.80-35.20	30.10-37.70	25.60-28.00	29.20	35.00-36.49	38.00-39.75
" – B	60.50	40.00-42.50	38.50-42.30	30.40-31.00	25.00-34.20	21.30-22.80	24.30	29.00-31.22	33.15-34.00
" – C	15.00	10.30-11.00	9.70-10.60	7.30-7.70	7.00-8.70	7.00-7.20	7.20	7.60-9.10	8.30-9.39
" – D	7.40	5.30-5.80	4.90-5.30	3.60-3.90	3.20-4.40	3.00-3.50	3.40	4.57	4.31
" – E	11.20	7.80-8.20	7.80-8.40	5.40-6.20	5.40-6.20	5.00-5.20	5.00	6.00-6.98	6.00-6.68
" – E1	5.80	3.90-4.00	3.50-4.20	2.70-3.00	2.40-3.10	2.40-2.60	2.50	3.35-3.50	3.30-4.00
я – н	15.30	10.00-10.50	9.80-11.00	7.10-7.70	6.40-8.00	6.00-6.30	6.30	8.50-8.81	9.22-9.50
9 – "	7.00	4.50-4.60	4.00-5.00	3.10-3.20	2.80-3.70	2.50-2.80	3.10	3.65	3.90
<i>phalanga</i> 1. digiti II. – A	35.00	21.00	22.00	17.00	18.00	11.00	13.00	15.00	18.00
" – C	8.50	6.00	6.50	5.00	4.00	3.50	3.50	5.00	5.50
" – E	9.50	7.00	7.00	5.50	4.50	4.00	4.00	6.00	6.50
Я <i>- "</i>	8.00	6.00	6.00	4.50	4.00	3.00	3.00	4.50	5.00

Bone (Figure 11–13)	Corvus corax	C. corone	C. frugilegus	C. monedula	Pica pica	Garrulus gland.	Nucifraga caryoc.	Pyrrhocorax gr.	P. pyrrhocorax
femur – A	67.70	45.80-53.50	45.50-47.90	36.40-38.60	36.20-42.20	36.60-37.90	38.70	40.00-41.10	40.90-42.50
" – B	64.00	42.50-50.00	42.80-45.00	34.20-36.20	34.00-40.00	34.40-35.70	36.70	38.50-39.1	38.50-40.50
" – C	15.30	9.60-10.30	9.00-10.00	6.90-7.70	7.00-8.00	6.90-7.20	7.00	7.30-8.00	8.30-9.00
" – D	9.10	6.20-6.50	5.80–6.80	4.00-4.40	4.20-5.30	4.30-4.70	4.20	4.64–50	5.20-5.60
" – E	6.50	4.30–4.80	4.00–4.30	3.00-3.10	3.20-3.60	3.00-3.20	3.00	3.49-3.60	4.03
- F	14.70	10.00-10.60	9.20-10.00	6.90-7.80	7.00-7.90	6.80-7.00	7.70	7.60-8.25	9.23-9.60
" – G	11.60	8.00-8.80	7.50-8.20	5.80-6.20	5.40-6.20	5.20-5.80	5.80	6.71-6.90	7.67-8.00
tibiotarsus – A	112.00	81.30-89.20	79.00-84.00	63.10-64.80	58.40-70.60	58.30-61.40	59.30	71.95-77.50	69.00-75.38
" – B	18.20	12.40-13.80	13.00	8.90-9.60	8.70-10.20	8.70-9.20	8.10	10.69-12.30	10.00-12.19
" – C	12.80	8.90–9.20	7.50-8.80	5.80-6.90	6.00-7.40	6.30-7.00	6.10	7.25-10.00	8.22-8.80
" – D	6.00	4.10-4.80	3.80-4.60	2.80-3.10	2.80-3.50	2.70-2.90	3.00	3.20	4.45-5.00
" – E	5.00	3.60	3.70	2.40	2.70	2.50	2.40	4.00	3.20
я – Г - Г	12.00	8.10-8.80	7.50-8.60	5.70-6.00	5.40-6.70	5.40-6.20	5.90	7.32-7.50	6.50-7.08
9 – "	10.70	8.00-8.20	7.1-8.00	5.80-6.20	5.30-6.30	5.30-5.50	5.40	6.57-7.00	6.10-6.92
tarsometatarsus – A	66.00-69.00	51.40-60.00	51.20-55.00	41.20-44.10	40.80-50.20	40.50-43.50	40.70	44.80-47.65	51.00-56.50
" – C	12.00-13.20	8.80-10.00	8.30-9.30	6.10-6.90	6.50-7.10	5.90-6.20	6.20	7.04-7.50	8.48-9.50
" – D	12.20-14.00	8.60-9.30	8.60-9.60	6.20-7.50	6.90-7.50	6.60-7.20	6.00	6.70-7.88	8.00-8.45
" – E	4.80-5.00	3.40-3.80	3.00-3.40	2.30-2.70	2.30-2.70	2.10-2.40	2.30	2.80	3.02
- F	9.20–9.50	6.80	6.00-7.00	5.10-5.20	4.20-4.70	4.20-4.70	4.60	5.51-5.66	5.90-6.00
9 – "	5.50-6.00	4.00-4.40	3.50-4.20	2.80-3.10	2.80-2.90	2.80-2.90	3.00	2.89-3.00	3.35-3.50

 Table 6.
 Corvidae - femur, tibiotarsus, tarsometatarsus dimensions

 6. táblázat
 Varjúfélék - combcsont, lábszárcsont, csüd méretek

References

- Ballmann, P. 1966. Die Vögel aus der altburdigalen Spaltenfüllung von Wintershof (West) bei Eichstätt [The birds of the altburdigalen fissure filling of Wintershof (West) in Eichstaett]. – Inaugural Dissertation zur erlangung der Doktorwürde der nHohe Naturwissenschaftlichen Fakultät der Ludwig Maximiliane, Universität zu München, München (in German)
- Baumel, J. J., King, A. S., Lucas, A. M., Breazile, J. E. & Evans, H. E. 1979. Nomina anatomica avium. Academical Press, London
- Bindea, D. (ed.) 2008. Arheozoologia Transilvaniei in pre- si protoistorie [Transylvanian archaeozoology archaeozoology in Prae- and Protoistory]. – Trognost Cluj-Napoca (in Romanian)
- Bocheński, Z. M. & Tomek, T. 1994. Fossil and subfossil bird remains from five Austrian caves. Acta Zoologica Cracoviensia 37: 347–358.
- Boev, Z. N. 1995. Middle Villafranchian birds from Varshets (western Balkan range Bulgaria). In: Peters, D. S. (ed.) Acta palaeornithologica Courier Forschungsinstitut Senckenberg 181: 259–269.

Boev, Z. N. 2000. Neogene avifaunas of Bulgaria. - Vertebrata Palasiatica 38(Suppl.): 2-3.

- Bökönyi, S. 1964. A maroslele-panai neolithikus telep gerinces faunája [The vertebrate fauna of the neolithic site of Maroslele-Pana]. – Archeológiai Értesitő 91: 87–93.
- Bökönyi, S. 1984. Animal husbandry and hunting in Tác-Gorsium [The vertebrate fauna of the Roman town in Pannonia]. – Akadémiai Kiadó, Budapest
- Brodkorb, P. 1978. Catalogue of fossil birds, Part 5. (Passeriformes). Bulletin of the Florida State Museum, Biological Sciences 23(3): 139–228.
- Čapek, V. 1917. A püspökfürdői preglaciális madárfauna [The Preglaciale bird fauna from Püspökfürdő]. Barlangkutatás 5: 66–74. (in Hungarian)
- Cheneval, J. 1983. Révision de l'avifaune du gisement aquitanien de Saint-Gérand-le-Puy (Allier, France) (Gaviiformes à Anseriformes) [Review of the avifauna of aquitanien deposit of Saint-Gérand-le-Puy (Allier, France) (Gaviiformes to Anseriformes)]. – Unpublished Thesis (Nr. 1380), Université Claude-Bernard, Lyon (in French)
- Clements, J. 1974. The Clements Checklist of the Birds of the World. Cornell University Press
- Classon, A. T. 1980. Padina and Starcevo: game, fish and eattle. Palaeohistoria 22: 142-173.
- Cramp, S. (ed.) 1998. The Complete Birds of the Western Palearctic on CD rom. Oxford University Press
- Dickinson, E. C. & Christidis, L. (eds.) 2014. The Howard and Moore Complete Checklist of the Birds of the World, 4th ed., Vol. 2. Passerines. – Aves Press, Eastbourne, UK.
- Driesch, A. von den 1976. A guide to the measurements of animal bones from archaeological sites. Peabody Museum Bulletin 1: 148.
- Fischer, K. & Stephan, B. 1977. Vogelknochenfunde aus Quartären Ablagerungen Südwestrumaniens [Bird bones from Quaternary deposits in South-west Romania]. Annalen für Ornithologie 1: 79–90. (in German)
- Fladerer, F. A. 1993. Neue Daten aus jung- und mittelpleistozänen Höhlensedimenten im Raum Peggau-Deutschfeistritz, Steiermark [New data from young and middle Pleistocene cave sediments in the area Peggau-Deutschfeistritz, Styria]. – Fundberichte aus Österreich 31: 369–374. (in German)
- Fürbringer, M. 1888. Untersuchungen zur Morphologie und Systematik der Vögel, zugleich ein Beitrag zur Anatomie der Stutz- und Bewegungeorgane [Studies on the morphology and systematics of birds, also contribute to the anatomy of the mounting socket and locomotor organe]. – Amsterdam, Jena (in German)
- Gál, E. 1998. Avifauna fosila a pesterii Gura Cheii de la Râsnov (Jud Brasov) [Fossil avifauna of Gura Cheii cave in Râsnov (Jud Brasov)]. Studia Universitatis Babes-Bolyai, Biologia 43 (1–2):88–93 (in Romanian)
- Gál, E. 2002. Avifauna pleistocena a Romaniei [Pleistocene bird faunas of Romania]. Unpublied C.Sc Dissertation, Universitatea din București, Facultatea de Geologie București (in Romanian)
- Gál, E. 2003. Bird remains from two Romanian caves: Curata Cave (Nandru) and Bordu Mare Cave (Ohaba Ponor). In: ICAZ 2002, Abstracts, 56.
- Gál, E. 2004. The Neolitic avifauna of Hungary within the context of the Carpathian Basin. Antaeus 27: 273–286.
- Gál, E. 2005a. New evidence of fowling and poultry keeping in Pannonia, Dacia and Moesia during the period of the Roman Empire. – In: Gruppe, G. & Peters, J. (eds.) Feathers, grit and symbolism. Birds and humans in the Ancient Old and New Worlds. – Proceedings of the 5th Meeting of the ICAZ Bord Working Group, Munich, Germany, 26-30 July 2004. – Documenta Archaeobiologiae 3. Verlag Marie Leidorf GmbH.Rahden/ Westf., 301–316.

- Gál, E. 2005b. Animal remains from archaeological excavations in North-Eastern Hungary. In: Gál, E., Juhász, I. & Sümegi, P. (eds.) Environmental archaeology in North-Eastern Hungary. – Varia Archaeologica Hungarica 19: 139–174.
- Gál, E. 2007. Fowling in lowlands. Neolithic and Chalcolithic bird exploitation in South-East-Romania and the Great Hungarian Plain. – Archaeolinqua, Series Minor 24., Budapest
- Gál, E. 2008. A székelykeresztúri késő középkori udvarház állatcsontleletei [Animal bone remains from the late medieval manor house at Székelykeresztúr]. – In: Benkő, E. & Székely, A. (eds.) Középkori udvarház és nemesség a Székelyföldön [Medieval Manor House and Nobility in Székelyland]. pp. 301–355. Nap Kiadó, Budapest, Hungary (in Hungarian)
- Gál, E. 2010. Animal remains from the multi-period site of Hasjdúnánás Fürjhalom-dűlő. Part II. Finds from the Árpád Period (10TH–13TH Centuries) – Acta Archaeologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae 61(2010): 425–444. DOI: 10.1556/AArch.61.2010.2.4
- Gál, E. 2013. Bird bone remains from Bronz Age settlements in the Carpathian Basin. In: Vicze, M, Poroszlai, I. & Sümegi, P. (eds.) Koszider: Hoard, Phase, Period? – Round table conference in the Koszider problem, "Matrica" Museum, Százhalombatta 2006, 193–205.
- Gál, E. 2015. "Fine feathers make fine birds": the exploitaion of wild birds in medieval of Hungary. Antaeus 33: 345–368.
- Gál, E. 2017. Animals at the awn of metallurgy in south-western Hungary. Relationships between people and animals in southern Transdanubia during the Late Copper to Middle Bronze Ages. – Budapest: Institute of Archaeology, Research Centre forthe Humanities, Hungarian Academy of Sciences
- Gál, E. & Kessler, E. 2006. Songbird remains from the Miocene (Middle Sarmatian) site Credinta (Dobrogea, South-East Romania). – In: Csiki, Z. (ed.) Volume dedicated to Dan Grigorescu on his 65th birthday. – University of Bucharest Printing House
- Gilbert, B. M., Martin, L. D. & Savage, H. G. 1981. Avian Osteology. Library of Congress, Wyoming
- Hamar, M. & Csák, K. 1969. Contribuții la cunoașterea faunei de vertebrate pleistocene din Dealul Burzău (com. Rîpa, jud. Bihor) – jung Wurm [Contributions to the knowledge of pleistocene vertebrate fauna in Burzau Hill (Ripa, Bihor County) – jung Wurm]. – Studii și cercetări. Biologice Seria Zoologie 21(6): 4–25.
- Jarvis, E. D. et al. 2014. Whole-genome analyses resolve early branches in the tree of life of modern birds. Sciences 346(6215): 1320–1331. DOI: 10.1126/science.1253451
- Jánossy, D. 1952. Az Istállóskői barlang aurignaci faunája [The Aurignacian cave fauna from Istállóskő]. Földtani Közlöny 82(4–6): 181–203. (in Hungarian)
- Jánossy, D. 1954. Fossile Ornis aus der Höhle von Istállóskő [Fossile birds from the Istállóskő Cave]. Aquila 55–58: 205–223. (in German)
- Jánossy, D. 1955. Die Vogel-und Saugetierreste der Spätpleistozänen Schichten der Höhle von Istállóskő [The bird and mammalian remains of the Late Pleistocene Layers of the Istállóskő Cave]. – Acta Archaeologica Academiae Sciencentiarum Hungaricae 5: 149–181. (in German)
- Jánossy, D. 1964. Letzinterglaziale Vertebratenfauna aus der Kálmán Lambreht Höhle (Bükk-Gebirge, Nordost Ungarn) [Vertebrate fauna in the end of interglacial from Kálmán Lambrecht cave (Bükk Mountains, northeast Hungary)]. – Acta Zoologica Hungarica 9: 139–197. (in German)
- Jánossy, D. 1965. Fossiler Vogelfauna aus Mousterien Schichten der Curata-Hohle (Rumanien) [Fossil bird fauna from Mousterian layers of Curata cave (Romania)]. – Vertebrata Hungarica 7(1–2): 106–116. (in German)
- Jánossy, D. 1972. Middle Pliocene Microvertebrate fauna from the Osztramos Loc.1 (Northern Hungary). Annales Historico Naturales Musei Nationalis Hungarici 64: 27–48.
- Jánossy, D. 1979. Plio-pleistocene Bird Remains from the Carpathian Basin. IV. Anseriformes, Gruiformes, Charadriiformes, Passeriformes. Aquila 85: 11–39.
- Jánossy, D. 1981. Die altpleistozänen Vogelfaunen von Deutsch-Altenburg 2 und 4 (Niederösterreich) [The Early Pleistocene bird fauna of Deutsch-Altenburg 2 and 4 (Lower Austria)]. – Beiträge zur Palaontologie von Österreich 8: 375–391. (in German)
- Jánossy, D. 1983. Humeri of central European smaller Passeriformes. Fragmenta Mineralogica et Paleontologica 11: 85–112.
- Jánossy, D. 1986. Pleistocene Vertebrate faunas of Hungary. Akadémiai Kiadó, Budapest & Elsevier, Amsterdam
- Jánossy, D. 1990. Vertebrate fauna of site II. In: Kretzoi, M. (ed.) Vértesszőlős: site, man and culture, 187–229. Akadémiai Kiadó Budapest
- Jánossy, D. 1991. Late Miocene bird remains from Polgárdi (W-Hungary). Aquila 98: 13-35.

Jánossy, D. 1992. Lower Pleistocene Bird Remains from Beremend (S-Hungary, Loc. 15. and 16.). – Aquila 99: 9–25.

Jánossy, D. 1995. A Late Miocene avifauna from Polgárdi, Western Hungary. – Acta Palaeornithologica, Courier Forschungsinstitut Senckenberg 181: 203–206.

- Jánossy, D. 1996. Lower Pleistocene vertebrate faunas from the localities 16 and 17 of Beremend (southern Hungary). – Fragmenta Mineralogica et Paleontologica 18: 91–102.
- Jánossy, D. & Vörös, I. 1987. Die mittelpleistozäne Fauna der Höhle des Hungária-Berges bei Dorog (Gerecse Gebirge, Ungarn) [The Middle Pleistocene fauna of the cave of the Hungaria Mountain near Dorog (Gerecse Mountains, Hungary)]. – Fragmenta Mineralogica et Paleontologica 13: 97–110. (in German)
- Jurcsák, T. & Kessler, E. 1986. Evoluția avifaunei pe teritoriul României (I) [Evolution of avifauna on Romanian territory (I)]. Crisia 16: 577–615. (in Romanian with English Summary)
- Jurcsák, T. & Kessler, E. 1988. Evoluția avifaunei pe teritoriul României (III) [Evolution of avifauna on Romanian territory (III)]. – Crisia 18: 647–688. (in Romanian with English Summary)
- Kessler, E. 1974a Avifauna postglaciară de la Cuina Turcului, Cazanele Mari, România [Postglacial avifauna from Cuina Turcului, Cazanele Mari, România]. – Tibiscus 11: 113–122. (in Romanian)
- Kessler, E. 1974b Date noi asupra avifaunei fosile a Dealului Burzău Râpa [New data to fossil bird fauna from Burzau Hill (Village Rîpa)]. – Nymphaea 2: 159–167. (in Romanian)
- Kessler, E. 1975. Contribuții noi la studiul avifaunei fosile de la Betfia, jud. Bihor [New contributions to fossile avifauna from Betfia, Bihor County]. Nymphaea 3: 53–59. (in Romanian)

Kessler, E. 1977. Avifauna postglaciară de la Vadu Crișului, jud. Bihor [Postglaciar avifauna from Vadu Crișului, Bihor County]. – Tibiscus 1977: 255–260.

Kessler, E. 1979. Noi date paleornitologice din pliocenul României [New paleornithological data from the pliocene of Romania]. – Nymphaea 7: 135–138. (in Romanian)

Kessler, E. 1981. Noi date privind avifauna pleistocenă a Văii Ierului (jud. Bihor) [New data on the Pleistocene bird fauna of Valea Ierului (Bihor County)]. – Nymphaea 8–9: 259–264. (in Romanian)

Kessler, E. 1982. Avifauna fosilă și subfosilă a Munților Apuseni [Fossil and subfossil bird fauna from Apuseni Mountains]. – Nymphaea 10: 171–181. (in Romanian)

- Kessler, J. 2010. Új eredmények a Kárpát-medence neogén és negyedidőszaki madár-világához III. [New results with regard to the neogene and Quaternary avifauna of the Carpathian Basin, Part III.]. – Földtani Közlöny 140(1): 53–72. (in Hungarian with English Summary)
- Kessler, E. 2013a A Kárpát-medence madárvilágának őslénytani kézikönyve [Paleontological Handbook of birdlife in the Carpathian Basin]. – Könyvműhely, Miskolc, Hungary (in Hungarian)
- Kessler, E. 2013b Neogene songbirds (Aves, Passeriformes) faunae from Hungary. Hantkeniana 2013: 37-149.
- Kessler, J. (E). 2015. Osteological guide of songbirds from Central Europe. Ornis Hungarica 23(2): 62–156. DOI: 10.1515/orhu-2015-0009
- Kessler, E. & Gál, E. 1997. Resturi fosile şi subfosile de păsări din Banat [Fossil and subfossil bird remains in Banat]. – Analele Banatului – Ştiinţele Naturii 3: 141–144. (in Romanian with English Summary)

Kessler, E. & Gál, E. 1998. Resturi fosile si subfosile de pasari in siturile paleolitice si neolitice din Cheile Turzii si Cheile Turenilor (Judetul Cluj) [Fossil and sub-fossil remains of birds in the Paleolithic and Neolithic sites of the Turzii Gorge and the Gorges of Tureni (Cluj County)]. – Angvistia 3: 9–122. (in Romanian)

Kessler, E. & Moldvai, M. 1993. Studii biometrice şi morfologice asupra scheletului membrelor la Corvidae (Aves) (Partea I) [Biometrical and morphological studies on limb skeleton at Corvidae (Aves) (Part I.)]. – Studia Universitatis Babes-Bolyai, Series Biologia 38: 69–80. (in Romanian)

Kessler, E. & Venczel, M. 2009. Bird remains from the Middle Miocene of Subpiatră (W-Romania). – Nymphaea, Folia Naturae Bihariae 36: 27–36.

- Kordos, L. 1984. A bodajki Rigó-lyuk újholocén kitöltésének vizsgálata [Investigating the Holocene filling of the Bodajk-Rigó Hole]. Folia Musei Historico-Naturalis Bakonyensis 3: 31–42. (in Hungarian)
- Kormos, T. 1913. Kleinere Mitteilungen aus dem Ungarischen Pleistozän [Small releases from the Hungarian Pleistocene]. Centralblatt für Mineralogie, Geologie und Palaeontologie, 13–17. (in German)
- Kormos, T. 1914. Az 1913. évben végzett ásatásaim eredményei [The results of the excavations carried in the year 1913]. A Magyar Királyi Földtani Intézet 1913. évi jelentése, 498–505., 531–540. (in Hungarian)
- Kretzoi, M. 1954. Befejező jelentés a csákvári barlang őslénytani feltárásáról [Final report on the Paleontological Exploration of the Csákvár Cave]. – A Magyar Állami Földtani Intézet Évi Jelentése az 1952 évről, 37–69.
- Kretzoi, M. 1962. Madár-maradványok a betfiai alsópleisztocén faunából [Bird remains in the Lower Pleistocene fauna from Betfia]. – Aquila 67–68: 167–174. (in Hungarian)

- Lambrecht, K. 1912a A borsodi Bükk fossilis madarai Fossile Vögel des Borsoder Bükkgebirges [Fossil birds of the Bükk Mountains from Borsod]. Aquila 19: 270–287. (in Hungarian and German)
- Lambrecht, K. 1912b Magyarország fossilis madarai. Die fossilen Vögel Ungarns [The Fossil birds of Hungary]. – Aquila 19: 288–320. (in Hungarian and German)
- Lambrecht, K. 1913. Neueren Daten zur fossilen Ornis unseren Höhlen [Recent data for fossil birds in Our caves]. – Barlangkutatás 1: 173. (in German)
- Lambrecht, K. 1915. Fossilis nagy fülesbagoly (*Bubo maximus* Flemm.) és egyéb madármaradványok a magyarországi pleisztocénből [Fossil's Eagle Owl (*Bubo maximus* Flemm.) and other bird remains in Hungarian Pleistocene]. – Aquila 22: 177–187. (in Hungarian)
- Lambrecht, K. 1916. Az első magyar preglaciális madárfauna Die erste ungarische praglaziale Vogelfauna [The first Hungarian Preglaciale bird fauna]. – Aquila 22: 165–172. (in Hungarian and German)
- Lambrecht, K. 1933. Handbuch der Palaeornithologie [Handbook of Palaeornithology]. Gebrüder Borntraeger Berlin (in German)
- Malez, M. 1961. Pecinska hijena iz indije kod Voce [The Cave Hyaenas come from Vindija cave]. Geologiceskij Vjesnik 14: 221–244. (in Croatian)
- Malez, M. & Rukavina, D. 1975. Kristurbacijske pojave u gornjopleistocenskim nasla-gama pecine Vindije kod Donje Voce u sjeverozapadnoj Hrvatskoj [Cristurbation appearance in Upper Pleistocene at Vindija cave in Northwest Croatia]. – Rad Hazu knj. 371: 245–265. (in Croatian)
- Malez, V. 1973. Fosilne ptice Jugoslavije [Fossil birds from Yugoslavia]. Unpublished Dissertation, Zagreb University (in Croatian)
- Malez, V. 1984. Paleornitološki ostaci iz kvartarnih naslaga nekih spilja Hrvatske i Slovenije [Paleornithological remains from the Quaternary Sediments of some Croatian and Slovenian caves]. – In: Deveti jugoslavenski speleoloski kongres, Zbornik predavanja, 711–719. (in Croatian)
- Malez, V. 1986. Paleoornitološka istrazivanja u našim krajevima [Paleornithological research in our region]. In: Mestrov, M. & Sušić, G. (eds.) Ornitologija u Hrvatskoj, 205–212. (in Croatian)
- Malez, V. 1988. Pleistocenska ornitofauna iz spilje Vindije u sjevernozapadnoj Hrvatskoj [Pleistocene bird fauna from Vindija cave in North-western Croatia]. – Rad Jugoslavenske Akademije Znanosti i Umjetnosti, Varazdin 2: 31–203. (in Croatian)
- Malez-Bačić, V. 1979. Pleistocenska ornitofauna iz Šandalje u Istri te njezino stratigrafsko i paleoekološko značenje [Pleistocene bird fauna from Šandalja in Istria and its stratigraphic and paleoecological significance]. – Palaeontologia Jugoslavica 21: 1–46. (in Croatian)
- Milne-Edwards, A. 1868. Recherches anatomiques et paléontologiques pour servir à l'histoire des oiseaux fossiles de la France [Anatomical and paleontological research to serve a history the fossil birds of France]. Vol. 1. – Victor Masson et Fils, Paris, 472+ pls 96 (in French)
- Mlikovský, J. 1998. Early Pleistocene birds of Deutsch-Altenburg, Austria. Acta Societatis Zoologicae Bohemicae 62: 135–141.
- Mlikovský, J. 2002. Cenozoic birds of the World. Part 1: Europe. Ninox Press, Praha
- Monroe, B. L. jr. & Sibley, C. G. 1993. A World Checklist of Birds. New Haven and London, Yale University Press
- Mottl, M. 1941. Die Interglazial- und Interglazialzeiten im Lichte der Ungarischen Saugetierfauna [Interglazial and interglazial times in the light of Hungarian mammalian fauna]. Mitteilungen aus dem Jahrbuche der Königlich Ungarischen Geologischen Anstalt 35: 13–39. (in German)
- Mottl, M. 1953. Die Erfrorschung der Höhlen [The exploration of the caves]. Jahrbuch Naturwiessenschaft Abteilung Johanneum, Graz, 19–58. (in German)
- Mourer-Chauviré, C. 1975. Les oiseaux du Pléistocène moyen et supérieur de France [The Middle and Upper Pleistocene birds of France]. – Documents des Laboratoires de Géologie de la Faculté des Sciences de Lyon 64: 1–624 (in French)
- Musil, R. 1980. Die Grossauger und Vögel der Teufelsbrücke [The big auger and birds of the Teufelsbücke]. In: Feustel, R. (ed.) Magdalenienstation Teufelsbrücke [Magdelenian Station Devil's Bridge]. – Weimarer Monographien zur Úr-und Frühgeschichte 3: 5–27. (in German)
- Olson, S. L. & Rasmussen, P. C. 2001. Miocene and Pliocene birds from the Lee Creek Mine, North Carolina. In: Ray, C. E. & Bohaska, D. J. (eds.) Geology and paleontology of the Lee Creek Mine, North Carolina, III. – Smithsonian Contributions to Paleobiology 90: 233–365.
- Pike-Tay, A., Bartosiewicz, L., Gál, E. & Whitle, A. 2004. Body part representation and seasonility: sheep/goat, bird and fish remains from Early Neolithic Ecsegfalva 23 SE Hungary. – Journal of Taphonomy 2(4): 221–246.

Sibley, C. G. & Ahlquist, J. E. 1990. Phylogeny and classification of birds. – Yale University Press, New Haven Solti, B. 1996. The comparative osteomorphological study of the European small-statured Falcons (Aves: Falconi-

dae). – Folia Historico Naturalia Musei Matraensis 21: 5–282.

- Soergel, E. 1966. Die Vogelreste [The Bird Remains]. In: Ehrenberg, K. (ed.) Die Teufels-oder Fuck-senlucke bei Eggenburg (NÖ) [The Devil or Fuck senlucke at Eggenburg (NA)]. – Denkschriften der Mathematisch-Naturwissenschftliche Klasse der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 93–107. (in German) Tassi, M. 2006. Szendrő-Felsővár állatcsontanyaga [Animal bone material form Szendrő-Felsővár]. – Visegrádi Múzeumok Közleményei 2006, 15–30.
- Tomek, T. & Bocheński, Z. M. 2000. The comparative osteology of European corvids (Aves: Corvidae), with a key to the identification of their skeletal elements. Instytutu Systematyki i Ewolucji Zwierząt PAN.
- Tyrberg, T. 1998. Pleistocene birds of the Palearctic: a catalogue. Cambridge, Mass.: Nuttall Ornithological Club, ix, 720. [Publications of the Nuttall Ornithological Club, No. 27.]
- Wettstein, O. V. & Mühlhofer, F. 1938. Die Fauna der Höhle von Merkenstein in N-Ö [The fauna of the Merkenstein cave in North Austria]. – Archiv Naturgeschichte, new series 7(4): 514–558. (in German)

